



International
Labour
Organization

Final Evaluation Report
**Project Skills Development and
Youth Employment in Kosovo
(Phases I and II)**

Final Evaluation Report

Project Skills Development and Youth Employment in Kosovo* (Phases I and II)

* Territory administered by the United Nations pursuant to United Nations Security Council Resolution No 1244.

Copyright © International Labour Organization 2009

Publications of the International Labour Office enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. Nevertheless, short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to ILO Publications (Rights and Permissions), International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland, or by email: pubdroit@ilo.org. The International Labour Office welcomes such applications.

Libraries, institutions and other users registered with reproduction rights organizations may make copies in accordance with the licences issued to them for this purpose. Visit www.ifrro.org to find the reproduction rights organization in your country.

ILO Cataloguing in Publication Data

Final evaluation report : project skills development and youth employment in Kosovo : (phases I and II) / International Labour Office. Subregional Office for Central and Eastern Europe. - Budapest: ILO, 2009

ca. 88 p.

ISBN: 9789221221470;9789221221487 (web pdf)

International Labour Office

vocational training / skill / youth employment / development project / project evaluation / Serbia

06.01

The designations employed in ILO publications, which are in conformity with United Nations practice, and the presentation of material therein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Labour Office concerning the legal status of any country, area or territory or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers.

The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed articles, studies and other contributions rests solely with their authors, and publication does not constitute an endorsement by the International Labour Office of the opinions expressed in them.

Reference to names of firms and commercial products and processes does not imply their endorsement by the International Labour Office, and any failure to mention a particular firm, commercial product or process is not a sign of disapproval.

ILO publications and electronic products can be obtained through major booksellers or ILO local offices in many countries, or direct from ILO Publications, International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. Catalogues or lists of new publications are available free of charge from the above address, or by email: pubvente@ilo.org

Visit our website: www.ilo.org/publns

Acknowledgements

We the representatives of the Department of Labour and Employment of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Mr. Ylber Shabani, Mr. Hafiz Leka and their staff; the Senior Employment Specialist of the ILO Subregional Office, Mr. Gianni Rosas; the Skills and Employability Department, particularly Ms Jenny Sang, who managed the project throughout its life time.

A special acknowledgement goes to the experts in charge of the project, Ms Valli Corbanese, Mr. Sokol Elshani and Mr. Fatmir Burjani, who assisted us during the whole evaluation mission as well as Mr. Visar Rexha who provided interpretation services during interviews and meetings.

We would also like to thank the colleagues of the Youth Employment Programme as well as Ms Carla Henry of the Evaluation Unit, who commented on the last draft of this report.

Table of contents

Foreword.....	1
Abstract.....	2
1. Background on the project and its logic.....	14
1.1 Phase I: Skills development.....	14
1.2 Phase II: Youth employment.....	15
2. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation.....	17
3. Methodology.....	18
4. Review of implementation.....	19
4.1 Phase I: Skills development.....	20
4.1.1. <i>Network of eight regional VET providers</i>	20
4.1.2. <i>Employment counselling and career guidance</i>	21
4.1.3. <i>Self-employment and income generation</i>	22
4.2 Phase II: Youth employment.....	24
4.2.1 <i>Youth employment policy development</i>	26
4.2.2 <i>Active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth</i>	27
4.2.3 <i>Capacity building of labour market institutions</i>	28
5. Presentation of findings.....	31
5.1 Relevance and strategic fit.....	28
5.2. Validity of design.....	34
5.3 Project progress and effectiveness.....	35
5.4 Efficiency of resource use.....	37
5.5 Effectiveness of management arrangements.....	37
5.6. Impact orientation and sustainability.....	38
6. Conclusions.....	40
7. Recommendations.....	43

Annex 1 - Excerpt of the terminal report of the project	47
Annex 2 - Summary of achievement of project's indicators.....	78
Annex 3 - List of policy and research papers, training tools and material developed by the project	86
Annex 4 - List of pilot projects.....	88

Foreword

This final evaluation report of the International Labour Office's Project *Skills development for the reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo (Phase I)* and *Youth employment (Phase II)* is the result of a joint effort of the independent evaluation team, the Project's implementation partners and the ILO staff.

The final draft of the evaluation report was discussed at the last Steering Committee of the ILO Project in Kosovo, which was held in Pristina on 4 March 2008.

This discussion involved representatives of the labour ministry, the social partners, the donor and the ILO. The main findings, lessons learnt and recommendations contained in this report include the inputs provided by the Steering Committee.

Abstract

Quick Facts

Geographical coverage:	United Nations Interim Administration in Kosovo (UNMIK)
Mid-Term Evaluations:	February 2003 and July 2005
Mode of Evaluation:	Independent
Technical Area:	Employment
Evaluation Manager:	Gianni Rosas (ILO)
Evaluation Team:	Anthony J. Twigger (external evaluator) Fetah Kasumi (external evaluator)
Project Start	February 2001
Project End	June 2007
Project code:	RER/00/M05/ITA
Donor:	Italy (US\$ 2,617,028)

Background and context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

Funded by the Government of Italy with a contribution of US\$2.6 million, the Project *Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo* had an initial duration of three years, which was then extended through the donor's provision of additional funding. The project was implemented by the ILO in two distinct, albeit interconnected, phases that went beyond the originally planned timeframe. The first phase (2001 – mid 2004) supported the establishment of labour market institutions (i.e. the Ministry of Labour, the Public Employment Service and a network of eight regional training institutions), while the second (end 2004 – mid 2007) focused on the development of a youth employment policy and action plan,

as well as on the piloting of active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth.

The reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo was considered, at the time of project formulation, a pressing issue and an essential contribution to lasting peace and stability of the Balkans. To maximize the employment impact of the reconstruction and recovery programmes, a provision was made for integrating demand-driven, employment-oriented training into the overall recovery strategy. The aim was to tackle the depleted stock of human capital inherited from the previous decade, during which stronger demographic pressures, a low skills-base, and strategies favouring low employment-absorbing sectors made the employment levels of Kosovo the lowest of former Yugoslavia.

Building on prior achievements, the second phase of the ILO project revolved around the strengthening of the capacity of labour market institutions and the social partners to tackle the youth employment challenge. Technical assistance was provided in the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment policy and programmes, as well as in the pilot-implementation of active labour market measures targeting disadvantaged youth. The project established an employment and training fund that sponsored a number of school-to-work transition programmes (apprenticeships, internships and in-company training) as well as wage- and self-employment measures.

Purpose, scope and objectives of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the performance of the two phases of the Project in a comprehensive, systematic and objective manner in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impact. The evaluation assessed the relevance of the objectives and identified the extent to which the strategy had proved efficient and effective. Particular emphasis was placed on the review of project sustainability and impact, as well as on possible innovative technical cooperation features in employment and training. Given the particular context and the project duration, the evaluation also looked into the relevance of ILO's approaches to rapidly evolving situations (from post-conflict to institutional set up, institution building and policy development). It also assessed the

effectiveness of pilot programmes (direct assistance) and their instrumentality to the institution building and policy development processes.

Methodology of evaluation

Given the nature and length of the project, the methodology of the evaluation was based on quantitative and qualitative methods and included the analyses of various sources of information, including desk review of survey data and project files; interviews with government counterparts and project partners, direct beneficiaries, partner agencies, project management and staff; and direct observation.

Main findings and conclusions

Findings

The evaluation team was given access to stakeholders, beneficiaries, partners and other people and organizations associated with the Project. It found universal acclaim for the Project in terms of achievement of objectives and outputs, as well as management style and timeliness of response. More specifically:

- The Project was able to achieve its objectives because, since its inception, it has upheld a clear vision and mission –the establishment of an employment and training infrastructure – that has never wavered. The Project’s intervention logic has been both realistic and coherent; the implementation approach adopted allowed the Project to be flexible and thus to retain its relevance to Kosovo’s rapidly changing needs;
- The Project was able to keep a developmental approach, bridging the reconstruction phase with long-term policy and institutional development objectives;

- Capacity and institution building were always at the forefront of project implementation and this guaranteed sustainability and helped planning exit strategies and modalities that strengthened the sustainability of project's outcomes.
- The combination of education, training and employment in a coherent whole was another key feature of the success of the Project. In addition, the achievements of the first phase of the Project allowed moving to more targeted and specific policy and programme priorities of the government and the social partners;
- There was ample evidence to show that the Project achieved leverage far in excess of its funding. This was done through the establishment of co-sharing and partnership mechanisms. This practice became a model that the Government expects other projects to follow.

Conclusions

The evaluation team remarked that the ILO Project played a catalytic role by: (i) attracting many “outsiders” into the institutional framework of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW), thus fostering a system’s approach; and (ii) pulling together a wide array of line ministries, agencies and donors. During its second phase, it also obtained full support of the Prime Minister and its staff. Also, the technical assistance provided by the Project – spanning the government, the social partners and local and international actors – had an impact on policy and institutions governing the labour

Virtually all the lessons learned from the project are positive ones. However, the most important ones are described below:

- *The added value of networks that link employment and training institutions and services.* Such networks allow providing integrated services, fostering jobseekers’ employability and ensuring that employment and training services are targeted to the needs of individuals and to the requirements of the labour market. In

addition, the availability of such networks of institutions and their experts allow the design of measures that respond to labour market requirements as well as to the needs of disadvantaged groups.

- *The importance of leveraging on knowledge and expertise of employment and training institutions.* Investment in capacity building and human resources development has been the underpinning strategy of the Project throughout its lifetime. Such strategy was instrumental to the impact and long-term sustainability of the Project. Trained staff and institutions can quickly adapt the provision of effective services to changing labour market needs.
- *The link with work experience (simulated enterprises, on-the-job training, ALMPs) and the mix theory/practice were key to ensuring high placement rates.* The design of programmes that addressed labour supply and demand simultaneously through links with the world of work was essential to improve employment outcomes of participants. It fostered the relationships of public employment and training services with enterprises, allowed a better understanding of labour market needs and enabled the targeting of employment and training programmes.
- *The availability of broad packages of training and employment services (e.g. wage- and self-employment, vocational and non vocational skills) enhanced jobseekers' employability and broadened the avenue of labour market opportunities.* The Kosovo labour market is characterized by a rapid pace of enterprise creation and destruction. Workers are increasingly required to be adaptable and to be able to transfer their skills from one enterprise to another. The availability of a wide range of services provided workers with multiple opportunities to (re)enter the labour market and to make their career choices on the basis of a broader menu of opportunities, including the establishment of their own economic activity.

- *The need to develop methodologies and tools that are context-related and locally owned.* The value added of the Project was the development of local human resources able to design or adapt methodologies and tools to improve employment and training services. This ensured the sustainability and replicability of the reforms introduced through the Project.
- *International staff “advising” rather than “doing” is key for replicating and expanding knowledge and services.* Such an approach promoted ownership, increased local knowledge and capacity through learning-by-doing approaches and enhanced the longer-term impact of the assistance provided by the Project.
- *Communication strategies that are part of technical cooperation projects give visibility to institutions and donors, but also raise awareness on policy issues and reforms.* The use of communication strategies centred on the ILO’s principles and values contributed to raise the awareness of labour market institutions, the social partners, other agencies and organizations partnering with the project – as well as the wider public - on issues such as equality of opportunities, social dialogue and decent work. Such principles have now become integral part of the policy discourse on employment promotion.
- *Both tripartite activities and needs-based assistance to employers’ and workers’ organizations are essential to promote social dialogue on employment and training.* The Project worked together with the government and the social partners on the promotion of tripartism on employment issues. In parallel, it supported the strengthening of the capacity of employers’ and workers’ organizations to deal with the government on employment and training issues. Such approach ensured broader participation of the social partners in policy and programme development. In addition, it helped the social partners discuss a number of policy issues that were not part of the government agenda (e.g. strategies to address the informal economy, working conditions and gender equality in employment and training).

- *The formulation of appropriate and realistic objectives and performance indicators are of the essence.* The establishment of clear management and monitoring procedures and indicators was key to monitor progress, adjust activities to changing needs and to ensure Project transparency.
- *Combining technical cooperation activities with regular programmes of the ILO can only result in a win-win situation.* Technical cooperation can provide a framework for piloting innovative approaches, methodologies and tools that can be up-scaled and replicated in other contexts through ILO regular programmes. At the same time, regular programmes can support technical cooperation activities by sharing knowledge and expertise gained in other countries and regions.

Recommendations

During the evaluation, stakeholders expressed the request that the evaluation report highlighted their request that the ILO continued its activities in the area of employment promotion. The following recommendations were formulated by the final tripartite Project Steering Committee that discussed the report prepared by the external evaluators.

- Upon approval, develop a time-bound plan of action to implement the main pillars of the employment strategy (2008-2013), namely: expand investment in human capital, ensure an inclusive labour market, and reduce the incidence of employment in the informal economy;
- Establish a coordination and monitoring mechanism for the mid-term strategic policy framework on youth employment and related action plan, as well as social pacts on youth employment at local levels;
- Maintain efficiency, coherence and relevance of current employment and training system. The consolidation and monitoring of the existing system is instrumental to its future expansion;

- ◉ Keep flexibility in the definition of the mix of training and employment services (institution- and enterprise-based) also through targeted ALMPs;
- ◉ Keep on investing in competency-based methodologies to ensure consistency of adult training approaches throughout Kosovo;
- ◉ Conduct a review of the overall labour administration system to identify priority areas of intervention;
- ◉ Complete the modernization process of the Public Employment Service and strengthen the Labour Inspection System;
- ◉ Increase resources for employment and training measures targeting groups that are disadvantaged and/or discriminated against in the labour market;
- ◉ Develop strategies and programmes for both affirmative action and gender mainstreaming in employment and skills development;
- ◉ Further the decentralization of decision making to regional and local levels;
- ◉ Commit human and financial resources to the development of a policy/programme monitoring and evaluation system, including the establishment of clear performance indicators;
- ◉ Invest in enhancing the technical skills of the social partners on employment and adult training issues and fully engage them in the crafting of employment and labour market policies.

Final Evaluation Report

1. Background on the project and its logic

The project *Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo* was implemented by the ILO in two distinct, albeit interconnected, phases. The first phase of the project (2001 – mid 2004) supported the establishment of labour market institutions (i.e. the Ministry of Labour, the Public Employment Service and a network of regional training institutions), while the second (end 2004 – mid 2007) focused on the development of a youth employment policy and action plan as well as on the piloting of active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth. The following paragraphs outline the main strategic components of the two project phases. A summary of key results and main activities is reported in Section 4.

1.1. Phase I: Skills development

The reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo was considered, at the time of project formulation, a pressing issue and an essential contribution to lasting peace and stability of the Balkans. To maximize the employment impact of the reconstruction and recovery programmes, a provision was made for integrating demand-driven, employment-oriented training into the overall recovery strategy. The aim was to tackle the depleted stock of human capital inherited from the previous decade, during which stronger demographic pressures, a low skills-base, and strategies favouring low employment-absorbing sectors made the employment levels of Kosovo the lowest of former Yugoslavia. The main problems identified during the formulation of the project were: lack of infrastructure for delivering adult training; limited capacity to provide employment-oriented, competency-based training programmes, as well as lack of curricula and relevant training material; the absence of a system for the training and retraining of trainers and training managers; limited capacity to provide alternatives to wage-employment – such as self-employment, micro-entrepreneurship training and related assistance; weakness of labour-related institutions mandated to assist job-seekers (counselling, guidance and job-placement); and the absence of linkages between training and the labour market (active measures).

Against this backdrop, the project assisted the Kosovo authorities in establishing a vocational training system for adult unemployed and workers, in building the capacity of labour market institutions in the provision of counselling, guidance and other assistance to job seekers, and in developing a system for the promotion of self-employment through vocational education and training (VET) institutions and the employment services. The main

problems identified were addressed through: (i) the setting up of a network of training institutions, delivering employment-oriented and competency-based training programmes; (ii) building the capacity of the Public Employment Services (PES) to assist job seekers through the provision of career information, counselling and guidance services; and (iii) developing self-employment options, micro-entrepreneurship training, and follow-up assistance.

The project strategy was built upon institutional development and direct support components. The first component aimed to build the capacity of labour market institutions to design, monitor, and evaluate training and employment measures while the second revolved around the establishment of a network of regional VET providers (facilities, equipment, and training methodologies), the piloting of skills development programmes and the provision of employment services for selected target groups of beneficiaries. The direct project recipients were managers and practitioners of training institutions and employment services as well as employers' and workers' organizations. All activities were developed and implemented through the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) and with the participation of social partners, both at the central (National Tripartite Board and Steering Committee) and local levels (Regional Management Training Boards).¹

1.2. Phase II: Youth employment

The second phase of the project focused on the promotion of youth employment. Building on prior achievements, this phase of the ILO project revolved around the strengthening of the capacity of labour market institutions and the social partners in the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment policies and programmes, as well as the pilot-implementation of active labour market measures targeting disadvantaged youth. The project established an employment and training fund that sponsored a number of school-to-work transition programmes (apprenticeships, internships and in-company training) as well as wage- and self-employment measures. The institutional capacity building component comprised technical assistance and advisory services to the MLSW and the social partners, but also to the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport (MCSY), to the Ministry of Education (MEST), the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF), and the Office of the Prime Minister.

¹ Prior to 2002, the project counterpart was the Department of Employment and Labour of the UN Mission in Kosovo

Box 5 - Main lessons learnt for the ILO project in Kosovo

- ✓ ***The added value of networks that link employment and training institutions and services.*** Such networks allow providing integrated services, fostering jobseekers' employability and ensuring that employment and training services are targeted to the needs of individuals and to the requirements of the labour market. In addition, the availability of such networks of institutions and their experts allow the design of measures that respond to labour market requirements as well as to the needs of disadvantaged groups.
- ✓ ***The importance of leveraging on knowledge and expertise of employment and training institutions.*** Investment in capacity building and human resources development has been the underpinning strategy of the Project throughout its lifetime. Such strategy was instrumental to the impact and long-term sustainability of the Project. Trained staff and institutions can quickly adapt the provision of effective services to changing labour market needs.
- ✓ ***The link with work experience (simulated enterprises, on-the-job training, ALMPs) and the mix theory/practice were key to ensuring high placement rates.*** The design of programmes that addressed labour supply and demand simultaneously through links with the world of work was essential to improve employment outcomes of participants. It fostered the relationships of public employment and training services with enterprises, allowed a better understanding of labour market needs and enabled the targeting of employment and training programmes.
- ✓ ***The availability of broad packages of training and employment services (e.g. wage- and self-employment, vocational and non vocational skills) enhanced jobseekers' employability and broadened the avenue of labour market opportunities.*** The Kosovo labour market is characterized by a rapid pace of enterprise creation and destruction. Workers are increasingly required to be adaptable and to be able to transfer their skills from one enterprise to another. The availability of a wide range of services provided workers with multiple opportunities to (re)enter the labour market and to make their career choices on the basis of a broader menu of opportunities, including the establishment of their own economic activity.
- ✓ ***The need to develop methodologies and tools that are context-related and locally owned.*** The value added of the Project was the development of local human resources able to design or adapt methodologies and tools to improve employment and training services. This ensured the sustainability and replicability of the reforms introduced through the Project.
- ✓ ***International staff "advising" rather than "doing" is key for replicating and expanding knowledge and services.*** Such an approach promoted ownership, increased local knowledge and capacity through learning-by-doing approaches and enhanced the longer-term impact of the assistance provided by the Project.
- ✓ ***Communication strategies that are part of technical cooperation projects give visibility to institutions and donors, but also raise awareness on policy issues and reforms.*** The use of communication strategies centred on the ILO's principles and values contributed to raise the awareness of labour market institutions, the social partners, other agencies and organizations partnering with the project – as well as the wider public - on issues such as equality of opportunities, social dialogue and decent work. Such principles have now become integral part of the policy discourse on employment promotion.
- ✓ ***Both tripartite activities and needs-based assistance to employers' and workers' organizations are essential to promote social dialogue on employment and training.*** The Project worked together with the government and the social partners on the promotion of tripartism on employment issues. In parallel, it supported the strengthening of the capacity of employers' and workers' organizations to deal with the government on employment and training issues. Such approach ensured broader participation of the social partners in policy and programme development. In addition, it helped the social partners discuss a number of policy issues that were not part of the government agenda (e.g. strategies to address the informal economy, working conditions and gender equality in employment and training).
- ✓ ***The formulation of appropriate and realistic objectives and performance indicators are of the essence.*** The establishment of clear management and monitoring procedures and indicators was key to monitor progress, adjust activities to changing needs and to ensure Project transparency.
- ✓ ***Combining technical cooperation activities with regular programmes of the ILO can only result in a win-win situation.*** Technical cooperation can provide a framework for piloting innovative approaches, methodologies and tools that can be up-scaled and replicated in other contexts through ILO regular programmes. At the same time, regular programmes can support technical cooperation activities by sharing knowledge and expertise gained in other countries and regions.

2. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the performance of the two phases of the project in a comprehensive, systematic and objective manner in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impact. The evaluation assesses the relevance of project objectives and identifies the extent to which: (i) the project achieved its planned objectives, (ii) its strategy had proved efficient and effective, and (iii) the project is likely to have a long-term impact. The evaluation looks at the project as a whole, with a view to identify good practices and lessons learnt to be used as a knowledge base for developing future technical assistance packages.

Particular emphasis is placed on the review of project sustainability and impact, as well as on possible innovative technical cooperation features in employment and training. Given the particular context and the project duration, the evaluation also looks into the relevance of the ILO's approaches to rapidly evolving situations (from post-conflict to institutional set up, institution building and policy development). It also assesses the effectiveness of pilot programmes (direct assistance) and their instrumentality to the institution building and policy development processes. Finally, the evaluation reviews the relevance of the:

- Initiatives aimed at mainstreaming gender in technical cooperation;
- Involvement of the social partners;
- ILO's integrated approach and methodology for the development of youth employment policy and national action plans;
- ILO's employment-oriented approach to skills development (introduction of competency-based modular training, delivery of employment services and promotion of self-employment);
- Technical assistance to the reform of the PES and to the introduction of active labour market programmes (ALMPs);
- Communication and awareness-raising strategies introduced by the project;

- Partnerships and alliances established by the project.

The final clients of the evaluation report are:

- Policy makers, managers and practitioners of labour market and other institutions that partnered with the project at central and local levels, as well as the social partners and the donor;
- Project management, the technical Department (EMP/SKILLS), the Youth Employment Programme, the ILO Sub regional Office for Central and Eastern Europe and, ultimately, the Technical Cooperation Committee of the ILO's Governing Body.

3. Methodology

A pragmatic approach has been adopted for the evaluation based on both qualitative and quantitative methods. The following data sources and data collection methods were used by the evaluation team:

- a) A comprehensive analysis of various sources of information including desk review of survey data and project files, including the project document, technical and policy papers produced by the project; work plans; progress reports and minutes of Steering Committees' meetings;
- b) Interviews and meetings with governmental counterparts and project partners, direct beneficiaries, partner agencies, project management and staff. To that purpose a mission was fielded to the UN Administered Province of Kosovo from 29th August to 9th September 2007.

4. Review of implementation

Financed by the Government of Italy with a contribution of US\$2.6 million, the project had an initial duration of three years. A second phase of the same project was approved for the period 2004-2006. The government counterpart at the time of project formulation was the Administrative Department of Labour and Employment (DoLE) of the United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK). The new constitutional framework established the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW), which became the project counterpart as of 2002.² Since 2004 the project has been progressing through two interconnected phases, as reflected by the project document and its addendum: Phase I on *Skills Development* (US\$1.8 million) and Phase II on *Youth Employment* (US\$0.8 million). In 2004, the Italian Government granted a further financing of US\$534,443 to continue project activities until June 2005. An addendum to the project, centred on the strengthening the capacity of labour market institutions to address the youth employment challenge, was developed in August 2004 and another agreement was signed between the ILO and UNMIK (on behalf of the PISG-MLSW) in October 2004. In 2005 the Italian Government granted an additional US\$265,252 to expand ongoing technical assistance to youth employment policy and programme development.

The progress of the project was internally evaluated twice. A mid-term review was carried out in February 2003, while a tripartite review was held in July 2005 to assess achievements, lessons learned and outstanding issues relating to the youth employment phase. With the additional financial contributions received in 2005 and by re-allocating the savings accrued, the project continued activities until June 2007.

For easy reference, the key outputs achieved by the project are summarized under the two separate headings skills development and youth employment.

² UNMIK Regulation 2001/19 *On the Executive Branch of the PISG*,

4.1 Phase I: Skills development

4.1.1. Network of eight regional VET providers

Four Regional Vocational Training Centres (in Pristina, Peja, Gjakova and Prizren), were refurbished and provided with modern equipment to deliver training programmes to adult unemployed in priority occupations, according to the ILO competency-based modular approach that was adopted by the MLSW as the delivery mechanism for adult training in Kosovo. The ILO project introduced learning methodologies and invested in the development of human resources (i.e. training managers, methodologists and trainers) to improve labour market relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of adult training. Institution and capacity building of the MLSW, initially supported by the ILO only, brought about other donor agencies that were encouraged to mainstream their assistance within the institutional framework of the MLSW. Accordingly, the competency-based modular approach was extended to four additional adult training institutions sponsored by the Danish Technical Cooperation Agency (DANIDA) and to other private training providers that joined the Ministry's network. The ILO provided technical assistance to support the MLSW in the development of the methodological aspects related to trainers', methodologists' and managers' competencies. The Management of Training Institutions programme, that combined periodical training workshops with work-based learning, was extended to the managers and training providers working under the Ministry's aegis.

Project activities increased along the expansion of the MLSW regional network of training providers. The project specifically supported: (i) the development of communication and promotional tools for the MLSW services, (ii) the training of MLSW newly-recruited trainers and the continuous upgrading of trainers' competencies, (iii) a training and development programme for improving access of vulnerable groups to skills development and employment services, and (iv) the development of training policies. At the request of the Penal Management Division (PMD/Kosovo Correctional Services) and of the MLSW, the ILO project provided technical assistance to establish vocational education and training programmes within correctional facilities. Since 2004, employment and training services available under the MLSW network are offered to

detainees. The outcomes of Phase I of the project were discussed in the Tripartite Steering Committee of July 2004. The main areas of concern and relevant recommendations for the delivery of vocational training were synthesized in the policy paper *Challenges and Opportunities of Skills Development in Kosovo*.

4.1.2. Employment counselling and career guidance

The counselling and guidance component of the project was developed on the basis of an *ad-hoc* strategy that focused on the design of programmes and tools reflecting the ILO approach to human resources and training, as well as the principles outlined in the international labour standards. The staff development programmes designed under this heading comprised: (i) a training needs analysis workshop to identify core areas and elements for the design of the counselling and guidance strategy of the project; (ii) an international fellowship to provide practitioners with comparative information on career development policies and programmes, and to introduce counselling and guidance skills to PES staff, and (iii) a number of training activities targeting PES practitioners to introduce individual employment counselling techniques in all regional and municipal employment offices. Particular emphasis was placed on addressing the needs of the most disadvantaged groups of the population and the ways to identify and “treat” them with employment services. Project activities under this heading touched upon a number of areas. First, the activities resulted in the establishment of a new framework for the registration of unemployed individuals and vacancies. This new procedure was accompanied by the development of an electronic registration system (SIMPS) – now operational in the Regional Employment Offices – capable of aggregating administrative data along the requirements of a reliable and timely Labour Market Information System (LMIS). Second, an approach to sequence the services available in the employment services and to target individuals at risk of labour market exclusion was trial-tested with unemployed persons with disabilities (PWDs). PES staff were trained and coached in the provision of the service to this target group, in assessing occupational skills and types/levels of disability for vocational training purposes and in administering an incentive scheme designed to place

PWDs in private enterprises.³ Third, the 2004 assessment of career guidance services in Kosovo pointed to the urgency of establishing a career information and guidance system in schools.⁴ In this respect, work focused on the piloting of a training programme for 9th grade school teachers on career guidance services in compulsory education.

The lessons learned during the implementation of the counselling and guidance component of the project highlighted the need to develop a training tool for employment counsellors and PES trainers addressing: a) career development skills to improve the effectiveness of counselling services; b) equity and social inclusion principles and practices; c) the need to build and/or strengthen the training skills of those entrusted to replicate training; and d) the use of information and communication technology (ICT) for collecting information and/or delivering the service. The training tool was published in the Albanian language and is available in the Kosovo employment services (see annex 3 for a list of policy and research papers, training tools and materials developed). The main achievements in the counselling and guidance component of the project were assessed in the report *Improving Public Employment Services in Kosovo* that highlights improvements in service delivery and the challenges ahead (e.g. human resources development, establishment of a labour market information system, and the monitoring and evaluation of service performance).

4.1.3. *Self-employment and income generation*

The self-employment and income-generation component of the project was based on a two-level approach. The first level related to the promotion of self-employment through orientation seminars and entrepreneurship animation days to be included in learning events as part of the curricula of both last year secondary technical schools and adult training institutions/programmes, and career counselling sessions organized by the staff of the PES. The second level focused on the development of an in-depth self-employment training programme

³ The incentive system designed by the ILO project was jointly financed by the MLSW and an Italian NGO (CICA).

⁴ The EU-sponsored project (KOSVET) conducted pilot training activities in 2004, which aimed at mainstreaming career information and guidance into basic education. This work was undertaken with the support of the trained personnel of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare

delivered by VET institutions to those who had shown potential and initiative in setting up their own economic activity or business. By June 2004, more than 850 jobseekers had received induction training in self-employment and 173 had completed a fully-fledged training programme and developed their business plan. The delays in achieving the project indicators were due mainly to the late recruitment of self-employment trainers by the MLSW. This component of the project also tested the feasibility of measures targeting the most disadvantaged groups. In cooperation with the World Health Organization and the Ministry of Health and Mental Health Service, the ILO project designed an integrated training and self-employment scheme for previously institutionalized persons with mental disability. By April 2004 these persons were able to perform the basic tasks of the *Garden design, ornamental plants and landscape maintenance* occupational profile. The related income-generating activity received a six-month micro-credit from KOS-Invest (sponsored by World Vision International), which was fully re-paid by December 2004. Pending the development of an appropriate regulatory framework, this *de facto* social cooperative was given the legal status of non-government organization. Such a pilot initiative, however, was discontinued as the management of the Gjakova Hospital did not extend the detachment period of the manager of the NGO, who could combine the management of the organization with nursing skills.

To identify entrepreneurship promotion practices from other countries, especially those targeting young people, the project and the International Training Centre (Turin) co-sponsored a fellowship programme to Poland. The programme focused on the role of public and private institutions in promoting self-employment programmes. Three main lessons were drawn by participants: i) to improve the relevance and effectiveness of (self-)employment counselling and career guidance services targeting youth, ii) to improve the quantity and quality of education and training services for self-employment and entrepreneurship development, and iii) to establish the legal and financial mechanisms for promoting self-employment for youth.

To summarize, by June 2004 – when the first phase of the project was concluded – the four ILO-sponsored vocational training centres had provided competency-based courses to 1,609 unemployed; the trained staff

of the PES and of the four VET institutions provided employment and training services to almost 25,000 job seekers. The number of jobseekers involved in training programmes that were developed according to the ILO's methodology was even greater, when considering the other VET centres of the MLSW as well as private providers where this methodology was introduced. The project also: (i) developed 25 staff development programmes, (ii) conducted 1,800 participant/days of training and 50 group and individual coaching sessions, (iv) designed a number of training tools and packages covering the thematic areas of the project and (v) undertook a social marketing campaign on employment issues. In order to promote research and animate debates in the employment and social fields – as well as to assist the Provisional Institutions of Self-Government (PISG), the MLSW, the social partners, and other governmental institutions in policy design and programme development – the project prepared and/or commissioned a number of reports and policy papers on: i) the Kosovo skills development system and public employment services, ii) VET provision in correction facilities, iii) the establishment of an Institute of Labour and Social Studies, and iv) the gender dimension of vocational education and training. It also provided technical assistance and advisory services for the design of a number of key employment-related laws including the law on vocational education and training, the law on adult training, and on the National Qualifications Framework (NQF). The project also prepared a backgrounder for a feasibility study on the introduction of a system for Recognition of Prior Learning.

In the employment area, it conducted a review of employment policies and provided technical inputs and coordination to the work on the elaboration of the employment strategy of Kosovo.

4.2 Phase II: Youth employment

The key outputs and main activities of the second phase of the project are described in the paragraphs below. The policy development work was informed by the data collected through a research carried out to pattern school-to-work transitions as well as composition, size and working conditions of young people in the informal economy (box 2).

Box 2 - Young people's transition to decent work in Kosovo

Labour market indicators do not always reflect the difficulties young people face in the transition from school to work. The ILO school-to-work transition survey was designed to measure the degree of ease or difficulty experienced by young people in their search for, and access, to decent work. The latter is defined as work that is productive, generates adequate income and guarantees rights at work and social protection. For this reason, the school-to-work transition is divided into three major stages according to whether the young person: 1) has "not yet started" the transition (all youth still in school or inactive with no intention to work); 2) is "in transition" (all the unemployed, those who are working but want to change jobs or return to education, as well as youth who are inactive and not in school, but plan to work later, and those working with decent work deficits or in non-career or temporary jobs); or 3) has "transited" to decent work, e.g. all young people employed in a career or permanent job, enjoying decent working conditions and social protection.

In Kosovo, two questionnaires were adapted to local circumstances by the ILO project and used as research tools to measure the transition of young people: one for youth 15-24 and one for employers looking to recruit young workers. The survey administration was based on a participatory approach involving government institutions (Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport), employers' and workers' organizations and youth associations. The data collectors were trained by the project to administer the questionnaires and code the responses (September-October 2004), while the tabulation and cleaning of data was done by a team of experts of the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport (October-December 2004). The total number of persons interviewed was 1,352 youth (50.5 percent young men and 49.5 percent young women) and 251 employers. The results of the survey are reported below.

Traditional labour market indicators		School-to-Work transition indicators			
Inactivity rates	43.1	Transition not yet started	36.4		
			In school 27.7		
			Inactive 8.7		
Unemployment rate	49.5	In transition	58.9		
Unemployment ratio	28.2				
				Discouraged workers	2.3
				In-school, but job searching	4.4
				Unemployed	28.2
		Workers considering themselves unemployed	5.5		
		Workers wishing to change	8.5		
		Workers with decent work deficits	10.0		
Employment rate	50.5	Transition completed	4.7		
Employment ratio	28.7		Employed in decent work 4.7		

Source: V. Corbanese, G. Rosas, *Young people transition to decent work: Evidence from Kosovo*, ILO Employment Policy Paper 2007/4

4.2.1 Youth employment policy development

The project organized, from September 2005 to December 2006, a capacity-building programme for the development of the Kosovo Action Plan on youth employment. The programme comprised four main components: i) a series of thematic seminars on youth employment (September 2005-April 2006); ii) a training workshop on youth employment policy development (April 2006); iii) a number of follow-up and promotional activities (May-November 2006); and iv) policy endorsement (December 2006). The thematic seminars brought together policy-makers from seven ministries, employers' and workers' organizations and youth organizations to discuss policy options to address youth employment. Two working groups were established to devise strategies concerning labour demand and labour supply. The results of the work carried out by the ILO project in Kosovo (review of the adult training system, career guidance, self-employment opportunities, baseline data and analyses of the youth labour market, preliminary assessment and lessons learnt from the implementation of ALMPs) were discussed by these working groups (box 3).

Box 3 - Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan: A mid-term Policy framework (2007-2010)

The Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan was developed by policy-makers from seven ministries (labour, youth, education, economy, finance, agriculture, trade and industry) and representatives of employers' and workers' organizations. The work was undertaken under the aegis of the Prime Minister's Office and was coordinated by the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports.

The Plan comprises three parts: i) the first analyzes the youth employment situation in Kosovo, drawing from the results of the school-to-work transition survey; ii) the second elaborates on a set of policy options identified as priority by the government; and iii) the third describes the operational aspects relating to the implementation of the Plan. The institutional arrangements envisaged the re-orientation of the existing administration structures and functions to facilitate implementation and to promote accountability. A central unit (inter-ministerial committee) is established to oversee the implementation of the Action Plan, while local government institutions are involved in the identification of programmes and in the planning and implementation of specific initiatives. In addition, the permanent structures envisaged by the *Youth Empowerment Action Plan* are called upon to monitor progress in achieving the envisaged youth employment outcomes.

Source: Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan: A mid-term Policy framework (2007-2010), Pristina, 2006

The main objective of the training workshop “*Developing an Action Plan on Youth Employment*” was to strengthen participants’ capacity to develop an Action Plan by: (i) getting a better understanding of national practices and lessons learned with regard to labour market policies and programmes affecting young people; (ii) developing a framework to ensure a comprehensive and coherent approach to youth employment policy development; and (iii) identifying and discussing the objectives, targets and outcomes of the Action Plan as well as the respective responsibilities of line Ministries. The last leg of the capacity-building programme related to the finalization of the Plan, its dissemination among representatives of local government and youth organizations, and its endorsement during a national conference organized in December 2006). The main outcomes of the Kosovo action plan on youth employment are now embedded in the draft Kosovo Development Strategy.

4.2.2 Active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth

This component revolved around building the capacity of labour market institutions to design, administer, monitor and evaluate programmes to enhance the employability and employment prospects of disadvantaged youth. The objectives of the active labour market programmes were to address the specific disadvantages of young labour market entrants. Most of the pilot programmes were enterprise-based training (in-company training and apprenticeship) and work placement schemes. The initiatives were implemented on the basis of the guidelines, models and tools developed by the project. The latter are now being consolidated in a number of regulatory instruments.

The project provided technical assistance to the staff of the PES in order to set up a monitoring and evaluation mechanism to assess the impact of the ALMPs and to check, through randomized trials, whether substitution effects and other distortions occurred when implementing these programmes. The evaluation yielded interesting lessons in terms of versatility of the targeting mechanisms and employment impact (box 4). The measures appeared to be particularly effective for long-term unemployed youth coming from low-income households and ethnic minorities facing multiple disadvantages (low educational attainment, low

family income, and longer unemployment spells coupled with mobility constraints and stereotyped attitudes in recruitment).

Box 4 – Pilot active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth in Kosovo

The project verified the net impact of the ALMPs by comparing labour market outcomes of participants to the activity status of the control groups established in each region where the programmes were implemented. The data gathered shows a gross placement rate of 46 percent, mainly in partner enterprises

The data gathered confirmed that basic education was reaching most of the young people in school age, but that quality and labour market relevance of education remained questionable. The difference in placement between beneficiaries and control group with lower educational attainment was not particularly significant, while it increased manifolds for young people with lower and upper secondary education, e.g. companies were much more likely to employ young people after they had a period of on-the-job training or work experience. In addition, active labour market measures appeared to have a noticeable impact on wages and contract length, as beneficiaries were eight times more likely than the control group to receive a monthly wage ranging between €150 and €200 and to have employment contracts of 6 to 12 month in length.

In absolute terms, the measures having the higher impact were internship (52 percent of placement rate), followed by wage subsidies (50 percent), in-company training (45.8 per cent) and apprenticeship (40 percent). While internship, wage subsidies and in-company training worked equally well for both sexes, for young men internship and apprenticeship had a higher impact. The efforts made to target the manufacturing sector succeeded, with manufacturing companies reaching 11 per cent of total partner companies. Still, the service sector took the lion share, both in terms of participation and placement of beneficiaries (over 50 per cent).

Source: ILO Project Annual Progress Report, 2006

4.2.3. Capacity building of labour market institutions

Besides the capacity building work involving the Ministry of Labour, other line ministries and the PES, the project continued the assistance to vocational training experts in advancing the work on VET methodologies to improve the relevance of training to labour market requirements. One of the key policy recommendations highlighted in the review of the adult training system focused on the need to periodically monitor outcomes of the vocational training system and continuously assess impact.⁵ Technical assistance was provided to training methodologists in the design and implementation of tracer studies. The main difference between the tracer

⁵ Challenges and Opportunities of Skills Development in Kosovo: An assessment for Strategy Preparation.

study conducted in 2006 and those carried out in 2002 and 2003 consisted in the design of a statistically significant sample covering the whole network of training centres. Baseline data gathered by the project pointed to an increase in the number of young workers in informal and casual employment. In 2005, the project conducted a number of capacity-building activities to increase the understanding of labour market institutions on the informal economy and to devise strategies addressing informal employment. A capacity building workshop was conducted to review modern labour inspection techniques and raise awareness on the issues relating to informal employment. The capacity building of the Labour Inspectorate was perceived as instrumental for the achievement of the project objectives since the service plays a key role in the enforcement of labour law. The workshop offered also the opportunity to assess medium- to long-term technical assistance needs of the Inspectorate and to formulate a set of recommendations. Decent work deficits and the magnitude of the informal economy in Kosovo were also discussed during a roundtable organized by the Federation of Independent Trade Unions (BSPK), with the support of the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) and the ILO project. The proceedings and background material prepared, as well as the recommendations stemming from the meeting, were published by the project.

Another strand of the work of the Youth Employment project relates to capacity-building activities benefiting the social partners, especially with regards to the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment measures. These activities focused on the collection of baseline information on working conditions of young workers and their participation in trade unions, the implementation of a campaign on youth rights at work and the preparation of the statute of the Youth Network of the Confederation of Independent Trade Unions of Kosovo.

A number of activities were implemented with the Chamber of Commerce to promote self-employment among young people. These activities included the analysis of the environment for the establishment of businesses and the identification of possible red tapes that could affect self-employment opportunities for youth. This work resulted in the development of an information booklet entitled *"Biz Up: Starting your enterprise - A to Z directory for youth"* and the establishment of an

information desk and a mentoring system for young entrepreneurs within the Chamber of Commerce.

Box 5 - Promoting social dialogue on employment and training in Kosovo

Being the main actors in the labour market, employers' and workers' organizations have an important contribution to make in the design and implementation of policies and programmes promoting decent employment. Social dialogue at all levels on employment and training can provide a mechanism to balance, through consensus, the interests of governments, employers' and workers' organizations. Often, however, capacity building is necessary to enable employers' and workers' organizations and their youth networks to effectively participate and contribute to the shaping of national employment and training agendas.

Against this backdrop, the ILO project in Kosovo adopted an approach that envisaged both tripartite activities and needs-based assistance to each partner. The project worked closely with the coordinators of the youth networks of employers' and workers' organizations and supported them in the design and monitoring of activities aimed at promoting youth employment. Such learning-by-doing approach built the capacity of the youth networks vis-à-vis their organizations and the government, empowered them to contribute to the shaping of the youth employment agenda, fostered dialogue between employers' and workers' organizations and ensured broader consultation and participation in policy and programme formulation and implementation.

To conclude, the work on youth employment aimed at fostering inter-ministerial coordination and the involvement of social partners in policy design and implementation; addressing the identified efficiency gaps in the provision of employment and vocational training services; and providing a solid management base for up-scaling and diversifying active labour market policies and programmes. Such work generated a number of spin-off effects, including the decision of the government to continue, with major funding from the UNDP, the implementation of ALMPs for young unemployed at risk of labour market exclusion.

5. Presentation of findings

The findings recorded in this section of the evaluation report are listed under the headings: i) relevance and strategic fit; ii) validity of design; iii) project progress and effectiveness; vi) efficiency of resource use; v) effectiveness of management arrangements; vi) impact orientation and sustainability. In addition, annex 5 provides a summary of the achievement of the indicators that were set at project's formulation.

5.1. Relevance and strategic fit

All documents reviewed and the stakeholders contacted confirmed that the project had been highly relevant to the needs of the post-conflict Kosovo. The needs analysis carried out at the beginning of the project reflected the various needs of the different project partners. To adequately address the needs and priorities of the transition period, the strategy of the project was built upon a direct support and institutional development component.

Direct support was provided for the establishment of a network of regional training centres tasked with the delivery of both theoretical and practical training in priority occupations. Due to the institutional vacuum of the post-conflict period and the lack of economic development strategies, a constant and direct feedback with the labour market was ensured by the project management and the employment service to avoid the delivery of redundant training programmes. The multi-sectoral approach adopted by the international community for the reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo at the time was indicative of the skills required in the short and medium run.

The institutional development component related to building the capacity of labour market institutions in identifying and implementing training and related employment measures. In this respect, the activities of the project contributed to the introduction of policies and measures pertinent to the transition context and to the re-orientation of the training system. This component targeted the key labour market players, such as

managers and trainers of training institutions, local government, employers' and workers' associations, as well as the employment services.

The underpinning strategy of the second phase of the project considered employment not only in terms of unemployment of young people, but also their predominance in precarious and poor quality jobs in the informal economy. In this respect, core labour standards and other ILO instruments of particular significance for youth employment were used to benchmark governance and fairness of the youth labour market. The other assumption was that strategies to improve employment opportunities for young people had to be part of broader economic and social policies that translated into more and better jobs. Concurrently, to address and overcome the specific difficulties faced by disadvantaged youth in entering and remaining in the labour market, the project designed and implemented targeted interventions. The lessons learned from the implementation of active programmes reverted into the development of policies and strategies.

The institutional development component of the second phase of the project aimed at increasing the effectiveness of labour market and other institutions, including the social partners, in addressing the youth employment challenge. This component comprised the development of a combination of knowledge and tools for advocacy and services. The involvement of several stakeholders fostered a more coordinated and holistic approach to youth employment, combining the initiatives of different ministries and between central and local agencies. The project strategy also succeeded in bringing the social partners closer to the decision making process, thus ensuring broader participation in policy and programme design.

The direct support component focused on the implementation of demonstration activities aimed at improving effectiveness and targeting of youth employment programmes. The first phase of the project had brought to light the limited institutional capacity in targeting the most disadvantaged young jobseekers. Thus, the second phase supported targeted programmes for youth at risk of poverty and social exclusion, as well as redressed gender inequalities in access to employment and training services.

The project established close links with all the stakeholders and these links, together with the decisions taken at the regular meetings of the Steering Committee, ensured that the needs were continuously checked for relevance throughout the life of the project. As new needs emerged, the project addressed them and found ways of encompassing them into project activities.

There was ample evidence to show that all stakeholders, including the social partners, had taken ownership of the project concept and approach since the design phase. The project achieved particular positive notoriety by offering advice and assistance to all Ministries and organizations involved in skill development and employment issues, thus supporting many cross-cutting and sectoral activities. The project also established good working relation with the IPEC project on the elimination of child labour in Kosovo, which started in 2004. The two ILO projects shared premises and coordinated activities involving the MLSW civil servants (employment service counsellors, social workers and labour inspectors). Participation to active labour market measures of the end beneficiaries of the IPEC projects (children withdrawn from hazardous child labour and victims of trafficking) was planned, but failed to materialize due to the late start-up of IPEC re-integration activities. However, the two projects succeeded in guaranteeing priority access for youth 15 to 18 years old to the vocational training courses offered by the network of the Ministry of Labour and partner institutions.

The project has pioneered some ILO policies and practices in the region.⁶ For instance, the process used for the development of an action plan on youth employment as well as the approach to competency-based training are now being extended to other countries in the region. The project has complemented and linked with activities of other donors at the local level and has been influential in setting the policies and practices of projects financed by other donors. Examples include the Don Bosco Training Centre, a private training provider, and the Penal Management Division. Both adopted the competency-based methodology to provide vocational training services to disadvantaged youth and to persons serving prison sentences, respectively.

⁶ See list of pilot projects in Annex 4.

5.2. Validity of design

Despite the uncertainties and institutional vacuum prevailing at the time of design, the project established a clear vision and mission – the creation of an effective training and employment infrastructure – that has never wavered during the course of the whole project. The intervention logic was coherent and realistic, and was appreciated by the Ministry of Labour and the social partners. Outputs were causally linked to the intended outcomes (immediate objectives) that linked to broader impact (development objective). The overall project design was plausible and achievable.

The three specific objectives of the first phase of the project (network of self-sustainable training centres; employment offices able to provide vocational counselling and guidance; establishment of a self-employment training system) were undoubtedly achieved by mid 2004. This was confirmed during the interviews with key informants and by the physical verification carried out during the evaluation mission.

The second phase of the project followed logically, and built on the results of the previous phase in a well-designed, seamless fashion. All specific objectives designed in the addendum to the original project document – namely the strengthening of the capacity of the Government and social partners in youth employment policy development; and the introduction of pilot programmes to enhance the employability and decent work opportunities of disadvantaged youth – were reached.

Each phase contributed to the central theme of the project (the creation of an effective training and employment infrastructure). The list of partner organizations was impressive, each phase producing new partners to add to the list. Many ministries and governmental agencies became partners, as did other projects focusing on human resource and employment issues. This factor underlined the basic approach of the ILO project management – creating leverage through partnership. One specific example illustrates this point: one of the first phase objectives was to establish a network of three vocational training providers. By partnering with other organizations, the project contributed to the expansion of the training network of the MLSW to eight public providers. Other organizations were attracted to the ILO project because of the widely-

acknowledged success of its activities. The competency-based training arrangements and their link to labour market requirements were universally acclaimed as best practice, thus attracting other training providers to join in the training network. This process extended the influence of the ILO project and concurrently increased its overall delivery.

The post-conflict situation of Kosovo meant that many assumptions had to be made at the project proposal stage. The assumptions proved to be realistic: the socio-political situation did not worsen, the network of vocational training centres was included in the national framework and public expenditure provision was made to cover the counterpart's commitments towards the project. Project involvement in the drafting of bills relating to human resource and employment-related matters contributed to the standing of the project and it also minimized the risk that such laws might have had if their content had not reflected the realities of the new economic situation.⁷

Indicators of achievement contained in the project document were realistic and were exceeded in many instances. The project records were good and comprehensive. This facilitated the measurement and verification of the project performance indicators (see annex 5 for a summary of indicators' achievement). Gender issues were tracked, more so as the project progressed beyond the first emergency reconstruction phase.

5.3. Project progress and effectiveness

All stakeholders and partners contacted throughout the evaluation mission stressed the high quality of the project outputs, the high level of services provided by the project staff and management, as well as the timeliness of technical inputs. The project achieved its objectives and in many instances exceeded its performance indicators. By mid 2004 – at the conclusion of the first phase of the project – the overall number of people trained in the four ILO-assisted training centres was 1,609 individuals (compared to the planned 1,500), of which approximately 80 per cent subsequently found work as an outcome. At the time of the final evaluation

⁷ See list of papers and documents produced by the project in Annex 3.

of the project the overall number of people who had participated to competency-based training courses totalled 13,926 individuals (see annex 5).

Examples of project success that were consistently mentioned to the evaluation team were in the fields of self employment, employment counselling and career guidance, social and development policies, curriculum development, training of public sector staff, and the publication of researches and policy papers on human resource and employment topics. The efforts of the project in the development and dissemination of training materials, management tools and policy guidelines in the local languages have to be commended. They are a key value added of the overall project.

Another particularly successful output was the Kosovo youth employment policy and action plan. The policy design follows the ILO guidelines and is already being used as a model for other countries in the region. Also impressive, in the youth employment field, was the extent of project activities targeting disadvantaged youth through active labour market programmes. The placement rate for participants on the programmes was 46 per cent overall (20 per cent for women and 27 per cent for men). This compares very favourably with the placement rates for non-participants (control group), which were less than 10 per cent overall (2.3 per cent for women and 7.6 per cent for men).

The project extensively engaged the social partners in all areas of activities, thus improving overall social dialogue. A striking example of social partner cooperation was the strengthening of the youth network of the trade unions in raising young people awareness on their rights at work and the establishment of a youth network of the Chamber of Commerce, with the aim of familiarizing youth with self-employment and entrepreneurship development opportunities. Both sides admit that more remains to be done, but an effective start has been made through project's activities.

The project has achieved its success through the constant mainstreaming of ILO strategies and principles into its activities. Examples include the attention to gender equality and decent work principles, the use of best practices in the design, monitoring and evaluation of active labour market policies and in human resource development. Wherever appropriate, compliance with ILO labour standards has been assured.

Stakeholders were intensely proud of what they continually refer to as “their” project indicating that this had succeeded in ensuring local ownership. The share of ownership was not limited only to stakeholders – virtually all the people who met the evaluation team expressed their feeling that the project was “their” project. The project was impressively responsive to the needs of the Kosovo constituents and their priorities, as well as to economic and institutional changes.

5.4. Efficiency of resource use

Resources (funds, human resources, time and expertise) were allocated strategically to achieve outcomes. The financial situation was constantly monitored and, wherever possible, external funding or co-sharing was sought. It was in this way that the project managed to get the leverage that is apparent in the project outcomes and impact.

There was widespread agreement amongst stakeholders and others involved in the project that funds were used in an extremely effective way and that both project funds and activities were delivered in a very timely manner. This contributed to the achievement of the good results and to an efficient delivery of outputs.

5.5. Effectiveness of management arrangements

The management difficulties the project experienced at inception were quickly corrected and, since mid 2001, the project has been managed in a very professional manner, with timely delivery of technical inputs.

Despite the many difficulties, the Kosovo Government delivered most of the promised human resources, provided the funds to refurbish the training centres and co-financed the employment and training fund for the implementation of active labour market programmes.

The project governance was well founded and active. The project had the full backing of all senior Government officials from the Minister of labour down. There appeared to be a clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities of all parties involved and the project received adequate support from its national partners. Implementing partners provided the

inputs needed for effective project implementation, albeit with some delays in certain instances. The project Steering Committee had a good grasp of the project strategy and its contribution to the success of the project was significant.

Internal ILO relationships during project implementation were exemplary. The project received adequate administrative, technical and political support from the relevant ILO Headquarters departments and from ILO specialists. Communications between the project and all other agencies were also very good.

Project management monitored project performance closely and had appropriate systems to do so. Cooperation with project partners was effective and the project made good use of coordination and collaboration opportunities whenever they arose. This includes the ILO IPEC project in Kosovo, but it also applies to other donors and projects – for instance the European Agency for Reconstruction-financed project *Technical Assistance for Vocational Education Training Programme in Kosovo* and the Norwegian-financed UNDP Project on *Employment Generation*.

5.6. Impact orientation and sustainability

The impact of the project exceeded expectations. The leverage effect from a relatively modest financial investment by the Government of Italy has been exceptional. The project succeeded in:

- setting up the training and employment infrastructure of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, comprising a network of training centres delivering competency-based programmes and self-employment training, as well as decentralized employment offices offering job search assistance, counselling and placement services to the unemployed;
- contributing to the drafting of labour, employment and education laws as well as relevant policies and strategies;
- supporting the Government of Kosovo in the design of a coherent youth employment policy and action plan.

These are just some of the major achievements of the project, but they illustrate the enormous impact the project has had on the development of post-conflict Kosovo. The long-term impact of the project on human resources development is very clear: the basis has been established for decent work opportunities and for a reduction in poverty levels.

The project has concentrated on capacity building in the partner organizations and this has enabled a realistic exit strategy to be enacted. Partners are able to continue with the work thanks to the outcomes of the ILO project. The beneficiaries, including the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, appreciate the positive impact that the project has had, but they also realize that more needs to be done. However, there is universal acclaim that this project has done a remarkable job with the resources put at its disposal.

6. Conclusions

The project was able to achieve its objectives partly because, since inception, it has upheld a clear vision and mission – the establishment of an employment and training infrastructure – that has never wavered. The project’s intervention logic has been both realistic and coherent; the implementation approach adopted allowed the project to be flexible and thus to retain its relevance to Kosovo’s needs.

The evaluation team concluded that other key features of the success of the ILO project revolved around: (i) its catalytic role, which resulted in other donor agencies mainstreaming their assistance within the institutional framework of the MLSW; (ii) the capacity to work with a number of ministries, agencies and donors; and (iii) the advice provided on policy and legislation, which affected not only Government’ policy-making, but also the scope of other technical cooperation projects on vocational education and training and on employment.

The team also considers that it had been a privilege to evaluate such a well-run project, in which all the actors played their parts with enthusiasm and vigour. The project has achieved remarkable results and has laid a path for Kosovo to follow to further its development. It has enhanced the ILO image and has put ILO strategies and principle of human resource development and decent work at the forefront of economic advancement. It fully deserves the award given to it by the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare as the model for other projects to follow.

Virtually all the lessons learned from the project are positive ones. The most important lessons learnt were discussed during the final Steering Committee of the ILO Project in Kosovo, which was held in Pristina on the 4th March 2008. These are summarized in box 1 and detailed under the following two sub-headings.

1. *Project design, implementation and evaluation*

- The formulation of appropriate and realistic objectives aligned to the particular country situation is of the essence. Objectives should be accompanied by realistic performance indicators. At the same time, however, it is necessary to adopt during project implementation a flexible approach that enables the project to take account of, and adapt to, changing national circumstances.
- Another key feature of project success is to ensure that the project stakeholders, partner institutions and other organizations directly associated with the project, are constantly involved in the planning and implementation of activities. The extensive dialogue established by the project with the many national and international actors present in Kosovo did yield results in terms of visibility, leverage and impact.
- Capacity building of partner institutions should be a key component of any project strategy, as it guarantees sustainability and helps plan and administer exit modalities that strengthen – instead of weakening – the sustainability of project’s outcomes.
- The practice to seek co-financing and in-kind contribution from many stakeholders to leverage on the funds available to the project is a lesson that could be mainstreamed in most technical cooperation projects. Despite the considerable time investment that such practice entails, it does pay off in terms of quantity and quality of outputs, stakeholders’ and beneficiaries’ satisfaction as well as response capacity of the project to emerging needs.
- The establishment of stringent project management control and monitoring procedures is only apparently in contradiction with the need of maintaining a flexible approach during project implementation. In fact, close management control and monitoring ensures that the governance system of the project at field level is transparent, equitable and technically sound.

2. Skills development and youth employment

- The promotion of decentralization of decision-making on training at regional level was partly offset by the fact that most of the administrative and financial competencies were retained at central level.⁸ Thus, while most of the knowledge and experience on the management of training institutions and vocational training programmes has been acquired at the regional level, the administrative and financial decisions (specifically on human resource recruitment, goods' and services' procurement and disbursements of funds) rested with various Departments of the Ministry of Labour, with no knowledge on the specific requirements of the VET system.
- In circumstances where international organizations and NGOs offer salaries that are much higher than those established in the national salary scale, it is extremely difficult for projects working in partnership with national public institutions to ensure that staff included in human resource development programmes remains attached to those institutions. The best approach is to develop the capacities of a core group of trainers able to mainstream knowledge and expertise to newly-recruited staff. Such group needs to be large enough to guarantee the return-on-investment and sustainability of staff development activities.
- Substantive technical support is required to enable labour market institutions – including the social partners – to effectively tackle the complexity of youth employment policy design, monitoring and evaluation. Technical assistance should be made available not only at the design stage, but also during the implementation, monitoring and evaluation phases.

⁸ The law on public procurement and financial accountability *de facto* impedes the Ministry of Labour to decentralized these vital functions to the training centres.

7. Recommendations

During the evaluation meetings, stakeholders expressed the hope that the ILO project would continue its activities in some form or other. The project has committed to finalize and disseminate, with the remaining funds of the project budget, the publications of the last policy documents prepared under the project aegis, namely the school-to work transition survey of Kosovo and the Country Review of Employment Policy. The following recommendations stem from the discussions held with the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and are based on the challenges that lie ahead for the same Ministry.

- Labour market institutions in Kosovo will soon be faced with the challenge to deliver on the objectives of the Kosovo Employment Strategy as well as to enforce the provisions of the Employment Promotion Law. The PISG and the Ministry of Labour, therefore, should proceed with the reforms of the labour administration –as suggested by the ILO project– as soon as possible. The areas of reform include: (i) the decentralization of decision-making from the Employment Department to its operational structure at regional and local levels; (ii) the completion of the modernization process of the employment services and the creation of a National Employment Agency; and (iii) the strengthening of the labour inspectorate’s capacity to tackle the informal economy and to effectively protect workers.
- There is a need to strengthen the governance system at both central and local level for the implementation of the outcomes envisaged by the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan. Such governance system would also be instrumental in aligning the objectives set by economic and social policies – especially the development and the employment strategies – to the youth employment policy objectives. The PISG and the Ministry of Labour should ensure that such governance system has adequate financial and human resources during the implementation of the Employment Strategy and Youth Action Plan, also through extra-budgetary sources. The

establishment of social (territorial) pacts on youth employment at regional and municipal level would also facilitate the translation of broad youth employment policy objectives into concrete projects that addresses the specific disadvantages of young people in local labour markets.

- The integration of core employability skills into the competency-based curricula developed for the training centres could not be completed during the lifetime of the ILO project. The Ministry of Labour, therefore, should ensure the continuation of such work through the technical cooperation projects on vocational training currently being implemented under its aegis.
- Gender mainstreaming approaches can result insufficient in contexts where gender imbalances in employment and training are rather significant. The PISG, the Ministry of Labour and the Gender Commission should explore the affirmative action policies to promote equality in the world of work.
- The monitoring system developed by the project to measure the performance of the adult training system offered the Ministry of Labour a tool to appraise the labour market returns of investing public funds in VET. The Ministry of Labour should continue these endeavours and commit human and financial resources to periodically verify the labour market outcomes of vocational training programmes.
- The involvement of social partners can bring focus on issues (e.g. informal economy, working conditions, youth discouragement and inactivity, the promotion of socially responsible enterprises) that are not always in the government's agenda. To this end, the ILO is called upon to provide assistance to further strengthen the capacity of employers' and workers' organizations to shape the employment and labour market policy agendas.
- One of the success factors of ALMPs targeting youth at risk of exclusion is the availability of statistical data detecting the main determinants of labour market disadvantage. Hence, it is

recommended that the Ministry of Labour and the Statistical Office of Kosovo, with the technical assistance of the ILO, regularly run the research tools developed by the project. This is particularly the case for the school-to-work transition instrument, which should become part of the yearly Labour Force Survey.

- The evaluation of active labour market programmes: i) allows the assessment of which programme work best and for whom; ii) provides insights in the performance of the institutions mandated to programmes' administration; and iii) helps planning the financial and human resource allocation necessary to achieve policy objectives. The Ministry of Labour should make sure that each year resources be earmarked in the Kosovo Consolidated budget to carry out the impact evaluation of the active labour market programmes implemented.
- The outreach capacity toward vulnerable groups built by the employment services during project life needs to be maintained and nurtured. To this end, it is indispensable that the Ministry of Economy and Finance allocate sufficient financial resources to enable the service to execute its functions. Given the constraints faced by the PISG in the recruitment of civil servants, it is suggested that the Ministry of Labour, with the assistance of the ILO, carries out an audit of the service with a view to allocate existing human resources in a more efficient and effective manner.

These recommendations were discussed and approved during the final Steering Committee of the ILO project in Kosovo in March 2008. During the meeting, the Steering Committee proposed that a summary of the key recommendations be brought to the attention of the Minister of Labour (box 6).

Box 6 - Main recommendations to the MLSW of Kosovo on employment and adult training

- Upon approval, develop a time-bound plan of action to implement the main pillars of the employment strategy (2008-2013), namely: expand investment in human capital, ensure an inclusive labour market, and reduce the incidence of employment in the informal economy;
- Establish a coordination and monitoring mechanism for the mid-term strategic policy framework on youth employment and related action plan, as well as social pacts on youth employment at local levels;
- Maintain efficiency, coherence and relevance of current employment and training system. The consolidation and monitoring of the existing system is instrumental to its future expansion;
- Keep flexibility and the mix of training and employment services (institution- and enterprise-based) also through targeted ALMPs;
- Keep on investing in competency-based methodologies to ensure consistency of adult training approaches throughout Kosovo;
- Conduct a review of the overall labour administration system to identify priority areas of intervention;
- Complete the modernization process of employment services and strengthen the labour inspectorate;
- Increase resources for employment and training measures targeting groups that are disadvantaged and/or discriminated against in the labour market;
- Develop strategies and programmes for affirmative action and gender mainstreaming in employment and skills development;
- Further the decentralization of decision making to regional and local levels;
- Commit human and financial resources to the development of a policy/programme monitoring and evaluation system, including the establishment of clear performance indicators;
- Invest in enhancing the technical skills of the social partners on employment and adult training issues and fully engage them in the crafting of employment and labour market policies.

Annexes

Annex 1

Skills development and youth employment in Kosovo Project Terminal Report (Excerpt)

OUTPUTS PRODUCED

The Project comprised 27 outputs (15 for the skills development phase and 12 for the youth employment phase). The paragraphs below indicate the extent to which the planned outputs were achieved. For reporting purposes, the outputs are summarized separately under the two phases of the Project.

Phase I: Skills development

Output 1.1

Project operational framework, including the appointment of project staff, the Steering Committee (SC) and three management boards (MBs) established

The Chief Technical Adviser appointed at the Project's inception left the post for medical reasons in the first quarter of the Project's life. This caused some initial management difficulties that were rapidly overcome. From mid-2001 to mid-2006, the Project was managed by a resident Chief Technical Adviser and from mid-2006 until project termination by an international consultant. Local support staff were recruited early in the life of the Project and remained in their posts for most of the project life. The Steering Committee, established in early 2001, met regularly twice a year throughout the implementation of the Project.

The Project promoted the establishment of a system whereby decision-making was decentralized to the regional level. In this respect, both a national advisory committee and four management boards – one for each of the targeted regions – were established to promote decentralization of social dialogue on training. The monitoring of such a system, however, proved to be time consuming, and the decision-making was in some respects sluggish. During the selection of occupational profiles for the

vocational training centres (VTCs), little attention was given to meet the needs of a wider number of vulnerable groups (rural women, women heads of household, persons with disabilities and ethnic minorities). Such shortcomings in the selection of occupations limited the access of the most vulnerable groups to vocational training. The rigidities posed by such a selection process were overcome by a system of contracting training that the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) initiated in 2003 under the aegis of the Project. As of May 2005, flexibility in training provision was further expanded through on-the-job training schemes designed as part of active labour market programmes (ALMPs) targeting disadvantaged youth.

Output 1.2

Training facilities assessed, rehabilitated and refurbished with training equipment

Four priority geographical areas were identified at the inception of the Project, although only three were indicated in the Project Document. The fourth training institution, not foreseen by the Project, was established due to the availability of the infrastructure (facilities and partial equipment).

By late 2002, four regional VTCs (in Pristina, Peja, Gjakova and Prizren) were refurbished and provided with modern equipment to deliver training programmes to adult unemployed in priority occupations, according to the ILO competency-based modular approach that was adopted by the MLSW as the delivery mechanism for adult training in Kosovo.

Output 1.3

A core group of 18 trainers selected and training of trainers' programmes conducted

When the first phase of the Project was concluded in 2004, the VTCs had 30 trainers delivering competency-based training in 27 priority occupations. Trainers for selected occupations underwent continuous development and upgrading in competency-based training skills and the design of learning material. When required, the Project also assisted in the upgrading of the technical skills of the trainers appointed. Each trainer defined and tested the optimal combination of theoretical and practical training for his/her

occupation on the basis of the changing employment needs. The VTC trainers were also exposed to country practices in developing and delivering competency-based training programmes through a staff development programme that included an international fellowship to Ukraine.

One constraint related to the achievement of this output was the high turnover of the Ministry's employees, including the trainers of the VET network. In 2003, the trainer's position, initially subsidized by the Project, was institutionalized in the national budget and salaries were taken over by the Ministry of Labour through the Kosovo Consolidated Budget (KCB). This transfer was considered essential to ensure the sustainability of project outcomes. However, the high turnover (approximately 33 per cent per year) of training staff meant that the Project had to invest continuously in staff development programmes to maintain quality training delivery. In 2004, a core group of training methodologists was established at the Ministry of Labour level to: (i) provide train-the-trainers programmes for newly recruited training resources, (ii) develop competency-based curricula and training materials, and (iii) assure quality training delivery. Since 2004, the development of human resources for adult training has been taken over by the national counterpart.

Output 1.4

Comprehensive competency-based modular curricula and training material developed and available for immediate delivery of training programmes, including lifelong learning-related skills

The ILO Project introduced learning methodologies and invested in the development of human resources (i.e. training managers, methodologists and trainers) to improve labour market relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of adult training. Institution and capacity building of the MLSW, initially supported by the ILO only, brought about other donor agencies that were encouraged to mainstream their assistance within the institutional framework of the MLSW. Accordingly, the competency-based modular approach was extended to four additional adult training institutions sponsored by the Danish Technical Cooperation Agency (DANIDA) and to other private training providers that joined the

Ministry's network. The ILO provided technical assistance to support the MLSW in the development of the methodological aspects related to trainers', methodologists' and managers' competencies.

Output 1.5

Training courses for women and men in 12 priority jobs designed, organized and systematically delivered by the network of training centres

When the first phase of the Project was concluded, the VTCs were providing competency-based training programmes in 27 priority occupations. However, the occupations selected by the regional management boards (see output 1.1) were predominantly male dominated. This resulted in a sensible gender gap in access to public training that was corrected during the implementation of active labour market programmes designed in the second phase of the Project. The Project also conducted action-oriented research on the gender dimension of skills development in Kosovo. The research analyzed the Kosovo labour markets, the educational and training systems and barriers affecting access to skills development and employment, as well as policies aimed at reducing inequalities. The aim was to provide inputs to policy makers for the design of new strategies and actions to improve equal opportunities in training and employment. One of the conclusions of the research was that gender mainstreaming approaches can have insufficient results in contexts where gender imbalances in employment and training are rather significant. Positive action could be an alternative, with a view to raise awareness and take action on the promotion of gender equality in the world of work.

Output 1.6

A framework for long-term sustainability of each training centre defined during the Project's assistance

To ensure long-term sustainability of the training centres, capacity building in five broad areas was identified as critical for training managers and vocational training coordinators of the MLSW, namely: (i) developing strategy and policy, (ii) managing the service, (iii) managing people, (iv) managing resources, and (v) managing information. A one-year training

and development programme on *Managing training institutions* was developed to address these issues. This programme, which combined periodical training workshops with work-based learning, was extended also to the managers of other training providers working under the Ministry of Labour's aegis.

To improve the effectiveness of adult training delivery, a two-cluster assessment grid was developed in August 2003 to monitor the performance of the training centres in terms of management, human resource development and training delivery. The results of the quality assessment analysis were used to fine-tune vocational training activities. As part of its exit strategy, the Project designed the package *Guidelines and tools for evaluating internal and external efficiency of skills development programmes* to provide the MLSW managers and training practitioners with an evaluation tool to identify areas requiring improvement. The package comprises evaluation questionnaires, formats and grids to identify key development and planning policies of the central administration, as well as tools to measure the internal and external efficiency of training centres. The MLSW methodologists used the package for evaluating the performance of MLSW-sponsored vocational training activities in 2004 and 2005. The main areas of concern and relevant recommendations for the delivery of vocational training were also synthesized in the policy paper *Challenges and opportunities of skills development in Kosovo*.

Output 1.7

A framework for training cum-production activities identified, developed and operational by the end of the Project at least in one training centre

Most of the occupations selected for the training centres had the potential for generating income. Such an initiative, however, was halted by the Kosovo Central Fiscal Authority in early 2003, pending the definition of the legal status of the VTCs. The enactment of UNMIK Regulation 2003/17 on *Public financial management and accountability* and of UNMIK Regulation 2004/3 on *Public procurement*, denied *de facto* the possibility for training centres to generate income. However, in the period 2002-03, two training courses of the Prizren regional training centre carried out training-cum-production.

Output 1.8

A range of common services identified, provided to and shared within the training centres' network

The 2003 Vocational Training Strategy for Kosovo was formulated on the basis of the ILO integrated approach to skills development that was proposed by the ILO Project. Competency-based modular curricula and training material – embedding also core employability skills – were developed and applied by all the MLSW training institutions by the core group of master trainers identified. By the end of the Project, the competency-based curricula were mainstreamed to all training providers that partner with the Ministry.

Output 2.1

One training course for ten selected training officials of the employment service organized and conducted in vocational counselling and guidance methods

The counselling and guidance component of the Project was developed on the basis of an ad-hoc strategy that focused on the design of programmes and tools reflecting the ILO's approach to human resources and training, as well as the principles outlined in the international labour standards. The staff development programmes designed under this heading comprised: (i) a training needs analysis workshop to identify core areas and elements for the design of the counselling and guidance strategy of the Project; (ii) an international fellowship to provide practitioners with comparative information on career development policies and programmes and to introduce counselling and guidance skills to PES staff, and (iii) a number of training activities targeting PES practitioners, with a view to introduce individual employment counselling techniques in all regional and municipal employment offices. Particular emphasis was placed on addressing the needs of the most disadvantaged groups of the population and the ways to identify and “treat” them with employment services.

Output 2.2

Three training courses for staff of municipal employment offices on vocational counselling and guidance organized and conducted

The Project trained all staff of the employment services (164 counsellors and 50 registrars) in counselling and guidance techniques through a staff development programme that comprised more than 30 training and coaching sessions. By mid-2004, trained staff of the employment service had counselled approximately 21,000 unemployed, while in the period July 2004-September 2007 roughly 105,000 unemployed received counselling and guidance services according to the new practices introduced by the Project (see also output 2.3).

Output 2.3

Active vocational counselling/guidance/placement carried out and linkages with the labour market with training as an active labour market measure established by the employment service

Project activities under the counselling and guidance component touched upon a number of areas. First, the activities resulted in the establishment of a new framework for the registration of unemployed individuals and vacancies. This new procedure was accompanied by the development of an electronic registration system (SIMP) – now operational in the regional employment offices – capable to aggregate administrative data along the requirements of a reliable and timely Labour Market Information System (LMIS). Second, an approach to sequence the services available in PES and to target individuals at risk of labour market exclusion was trial tested with unemployed persons with disabilities (PWDs). PES staff were trained and coached in the provision of the service to this target group, in assessing occupational skills and types/levels of disability for vocational training purposes and in administering an incentive scheme designed to place people with disabilities in private enterprises. Third, the 2004 assessment of career guidance services in Kosovo (*Improving public employment services in Kosovo*) pointed to the urgency of establishing a career information and guidance system in schools. In this respect, work focused on the piloting of a training programme for 9th grade school teachers on the subject of career guidance services in compulsory education.

The lessons learned during the implementation of the counselling and guidance component of the Project highlighted the need to develop a training tool for employment counsellors and PES trainers addressing: career development skills to improve the effectiveness of counselling services; equity and social inclusion principles and practices; the need to build and/or strengthen the training skills of those entrusted to replicate training; and the use of information and communication technology (ICT) for collecting information and/or delivering the service. The training tool was published in the Albanian language and is now available throughout the Kosovo employment services.

The main achievements in the counselling and guidance component of the Project were assessed in the report *Improving public employment services in Kosovo* that highlights improvements in service delivery and the challenges ahead (e.g. human resources development, establishment of a timely and reliable labour market information system, and the monitoring and evaluation of service performance).

Output 3.1

A framework for self-employment training and assistance defined, tested and operational

The self-employment and income-generation component of the Project was based on a two-level approach. The first level related to the promotion of self-employment through orientation seminars and entrepreneurship animation days to be included in learning events as part of the curricula of both last-year secondary technical schools and adult training institutions/programmes, and through the career counselling sessions organized by the staff of the employment services. The second level focused on the development of an in-depth self-employment training programme delivered by VET institutions to those who had shown potential and initiative in setting up their own economic activity or business. By June 2004, more than 850 job seekers had received induction training in self-employment, and 173 had completed a fully fledged training programme and developed a business plan.

Output 3.2

Self-employment assistance mechanisms - including counselling and post-training follow-up - defined and applied by employment offices, training providers and other key actors, in cooperation with business advisory service providers

Together with the self-employment trainers appointed by the MLSW, the Project mapped all commercial credit facilities, micro-finance schemes and business advisory services for entrepreneurship promotion. This information, constantly updated, is routinely made available not only to the participants of the training programmes offered in the MLSW training centres, but also to the general public through the employment services and the web page managed by the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Youth on career opportunities (<http://www.karriera.net/>).

Output 3.3

A group of self-employment resource persons established, trained and available within the VET centres

Some delays were experienced in the recruitment of the self-employment trainers, as the selection procedure of the MLSW was halted in early 2003 by a freeze in public sector hiring. However, by the end of 2004 all vocational training centres had a trained self-employment trainer able to deliver both orientation courses and fully fledged training programmes.

Output 3.4

Training programmes for self-employment designed, piloted, refined and conducted on a regular basis within the training centres

The sequence, content and training material of both the orientation sessions and the training programmes were designed by the group of self-employment trainers under the guidance of the Project. The initial programme design underwent a period of trial testing and refinement to adapt it to the needs of the target group and local economic circumstances.

To respond to the needs of trainers to identify best entrepreneurship promotion practices - especially for young people - the Project and the International Training Centre of the ILO (Turin) co-sponsored a fellowship

programme to Poland. The programme focused on the role of public and private institutions in promoting self-employment programmes. Three main recommendations were drawn from this experience: (i) improve the relevance and effectiveness of (self-)employment counselling and career guidance services targeting youth; (ii) improve the quantity and quality of education and training services for self-employment and entrepreneurship development; and (iii) establish the legal and financial mechanisms for promoting self-employment for youth.

The self-employment component of the Project also tested the feasibility of measures targeting the most disadvantaged groups. In cooperation with the World Health Organization and the Ministry of Health and the Mental Health Service, the ILO Project designed an integrated training and self-employment scheme for previously institutionalized people with mental disability. By April 2004, these persons were able to perform the basic tasks of the *Garden design, ornamental plants and landscape maintenance* occupational profile. The related income-generating activity received a six-month micro-credit from KOS-Invest (sponsored by World Vision International), which was fully repaid by December 2004. Pending the development of an appropriate regulatory framework, this *de facto* social cooperative was given the legal status of non-governmental organization (NGO). However, such a pilot initiative was discontinued, as the management of the Gjakova Hospital did not extend the detachment period of the manager of the NGO, who would have been able to combine the management of the organization with nursing skills.

Phase II: Youth employment

Output 1.1

Coordination framework, including the composition of the Steering Committee (SC), revised and operational

The original composition of the Steering Committee was revised at the end of 2004 to reflect the focus on youth employment policy development. The new Steering Committee composition reflected the expanded range of partners of the Project and included, alongside the Ministry of Labour and the social partners, also representatives of the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport (MCSY) and the Ministry of Education (MEST).

Output 1.2

Strategies and policy options to enhance youth employability designed, submitted to and discussed with the major stakeholders

As outputs 1.2 and 1.3 are closely linked, their assessment is presented together in the next paragraph.

Output 1.3

Strategies and policy options to improve decent work for young people designed, submitted to and discussed with the major stakeholders

From September 2005 to December 2006, the Project organized a capacity-building programme for the development of the Kosovo Action Plan on Youth Employment. The programme comprised four main components: (i) a series of thematic seminars on youth employment; (ii) a training workshop on youth employment policy development (see output 1.4); (iii) a number of follow-up and promotional activities; and (iv) policy endorsement (see output 1.4).

The thematic seminars, held from September 2005 to April 2006, brought together policy makers from seven Ministries (Labour, Education, Youth, Trade, Economy, Agriculture and the Office of the Prime Minister) employer and worker organizations and youth organizations to discuss policy options to address youth employment. Two working groups were established to devise strategies concerning labour demand and labour supply. The results of the work carried out by the ILO Project in Kosovo (review of the adult training system, career guidance, self-employment opportunities, baseline data and analyses of the youth labour market, preliminary assessment and lessons learned from the implementation of ALMPs) were discussed by these working groups and the lessons learned embedded into the employability and employment promotion strategies underpinning the Kosovo Action Plan on Youth Employment.

Output 1.4

Youth Employment Action Plan drafted by government agencies, in cooperation with the social partners

The results of the thematic seminars were discussed and refined by the members of the inter-ministerial groups during an international fellowship organized jointly by the Project and the International Training Centre of the ILO (Turin) in April 2006. The main objective of the training workshop *Developing an Action Plan on Youth Employment* was to strengthen participants' capacity by: (i) getting a better understanding of national practices and lessons learned with regard to labour market policies and programmes affecting young people; (ii) developing a framework to ensure a comprehensive and coherent approach to youth employment policy development; and (iii) identifying and discussing the objectives, targets and outcomes of the Action Plan, as well as the respective responsibilities of line ministries.

The last segment of the capacity-building programme revolved around the finalization of the Plan (including the monitoring and evaluation system), its dissemination among representatives of local government and youth organizations, and its endorsement by the PISG of Kosovo during a national conference organized in December 2006. The main outcomes of the Kosovo Action Plan on Youth Employment were later embedded in the Youth Development Strategy, the Employment Strategy and, finally, the draft Kosovo Development Strategy.

Output 2.1

A school-to-work transition survey developed and conducted in cooperation with major stakeholders

The school-to-work transition survey in Kosovo was carried out in October-November 2004. It aimed at providing Kosovo policy makers with a solid information-base to increase both quantitative and qualitative aspects of the youth labour market. The data gathering was entrusted to the data collectors selected in collaboration with the Project's stakeholders (youth centres/organizations coordinated by the MCYS; youth networks of the social partners and the regional employment offices of the MLSW). Data collected were verified, tabulated and aggregated under the coordination of

the MCYS in late 2004 and analysed in early 2005. The findings of the survey constituted the baseline for the development of the Kosovo Action Plan on Youth Employment. The final analytical report was published in the Employment Strategy Papers series in early 2007.⁹

Output 2.2

Flexibility, relevance and cost-effectiveness of public training services increased and more respondent to the needs of disadvantaged youth

Besides the capacity-building work involving the Ministry of Labour, other line ministries and the PES, the Project continued assistance to vocational training experts in advancing the work on VET methodologies to improve the relevance of training to labour market requirements. One of the key policy recommendations highlighted in the review of the adult training system focused on the need to periodically monitor outcomes of the vocational training system and continuously assess impact. Technical assistance was provided to training methodologists in the design and implementation of tracer studies. Three tracer studies were conducted under the aegis of the Project: in 2002, 2003 and 2006. The main difference between the tracer study conducted in 2006 and those carried out earlier consisted in the design of a statistically significant sample covering the whole network of training centres. The 2006 baseline data gathered by the Project pointed to an increase in the number of young workers in informal and casual employment. To increase the understanding of labour market institutions on issues pertaining to the informal economy and to devise strategies to address the expanding phenomenon, the Project conducted a number of capacity-building activities on decent work principles, how to detect informal working arrangements and on awareness raising on rights at work. A capacity-building workshop was conducted in 2005 to review modern labour inspection techniques and raise awareness on the issues relating to informal employment. The capacity building of the Labour Inspectorate was perceived as instrumental for the achievement of the Project's objectives, given the role played by the service in enforcing labour

⁹ This report is downloadable at <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/policy/cepol/download/policy07-4.pdf>.

law, and it offered the opportunity to assess medium- to long-term technical assistance needs of the Inspectorate and to formulate a set of recommendations. Decent work deficits and the magnitude of the informal economy in Kosovo were also discussed during a round table organized by the Federation of Independent Trade Unions (BSPK), with the support of the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) and the ILO Project.

Output 2.3

Programmes to enhance the employability of disadvantaged un(der)employed youth pilot tested as part of a comprehensive financial and operational scheme

As outputs 2.3, 3.1 and 3.2 are closely linked, they are analysed together under output 3.1.

Output 2.4

Counselling and guidance services for young people as well as self-employment induction training extended to educational and other training providers, the social partners and youth associations

The 2004 assessment of career guidance services in Kosovo pointed to the urgency of establishing a career information and guidance system in schools. In this respect, work focused on the piloting of a training programme for 9th grade school teachers on career guidance services in compulsory education. Local partnerships were also established between the employment services and secondary education institutions envisaging the provision of information on the labour market and career counselling to students. In addition, the employment services established regional networks with civil society organizations active in the promotion of the rights of disadvantaged groups of the population – Roma, Egyptians and Ashkalia (RAE); people with disabilities; and youth at risk of social exclusion– to provide employment and training services.

Another strand of this work related to capacity-building activities on youth employment benefiting the social partners. These activities focused on the collection of baseline information on working conditions of young people and their participation in trade unions, the implementation of a campaign

on youth rights at work and the preparation of the statute of the Youth Network of the Confederation of Independent Trade Unions of Kosovo. A number of activities were implemented with the Chamber of Commerce to promote self-employment among young people. These activities included an analysis of the environment for the establishment of businesses and the identification of possible red tape that could affect self-employment opportunities for youth. This work resulted in the development of an information booklet entitled *Biz up: Starting your enterprise - A to Z directory for youth* and the opening of an information desk and a mentoring system for young entrepreneurs within the Chamber of Commerce.

Output 3.1

Programmes to improve labour demand for disadvantaged un(der)employed youth, pilot tested as part of a comprehensive financial and operational scheme (see output 2.3)

The school-to-work transition survey carried out in 2004 provided the baseline data for the design of targeted active labour market programmes, including selection criteria for young participants and enterprises. The objectives of the active labour market measures, targeting 989 un(der)employed youth, were to address the specific disadvantages of young people in entering the labour market. Most of the pilot initiatives consisted of enterprise-based training (in-company training, apprenticeship and internship) and work placement schemes. The initiatives were implemented on the basis of the guidelines, models and tools developed by the Project. These were later consolidated into a number of regulatory instruments of the Ministry of Labour.

The Project provided technical assistance to the staff of the PES in order to set up a monitoring and evaluation mechanism to assess the impact of the ALMPs and to check, through randomized trials, whether substitution effects and other distortions occurred when implementing these programmes. The evaluation yielded interesting lessons in terms of versatility of the targeting mechanisms and the employment impact. The measures appeared to be particularly effective for the long-term unemployed youth coming from low-income households and ethnic minorities facing multiple disadvantages (low educational attainment, low

family income, and long unemployment spells coupled with mobility constraints and stereotyped attitudes in recruitment). The measures yielded a placement rate of 46 per cent (19.9 per cent women and 26.1 per cent men), mostly in the service and light manufacturing sector. In absolute terms, the measures having the highest impact were internship (52 per cent placement rate, partially due to the higher educational level of beneficiaries), followed by wage subsidies (50 per cent), in-company training (45.8 per cent) and lastly by apprenticeship (40 per cent). While internship, wage subsidies and in-company training worked equally well for both sexes, for young men internship and apprenticeship had a higher impact. The efforts made to target the manufacturing sector succeeded, with manufacturing companies reaching 11 per cent of total partner companies. Still, the service sector had the lion's share, both in terms of participation and placement of beneficiaries (over 50 per cent). Compared to the institution-based training programmes offered by the Ministry of Labour, the active measures yielded better results both in terms of gross placement and of costs. In 2006, the gross placement rate of the beneficiaries of the Ministry of Labour training programmes was approximately 26 per cent, with an average cost per placement of €1,000, while the average disbursement for the active measures was €640.

Output 3.2

A work-placement incentive scheme for employers hiring disadvantaged young un(der)employed designed, implemented and evaluated in cooperation with the social partners

See paragraph above.

Output 3.3

A system for promoting socially responsible enterprises offering employment opportunities to young people – including the establishment of a regulatory framework for cooperatives – piloted and refined

As outputs 3.3 and 3.4 are closely linked, they are reported on together in the next paragraph.

Output 3.4

A self-employment promotion programme for disadvantaged un(der)employed youth - including the piloting of a guarantee fund - designed, monitored and evaluated

The self-employment component of the package of ALMPs registered mixed results. On the one hand, the numbers of young self-employed rose significantly (this trend is more significant for young men than for young women). On the other, one of the main problems faced by self-employed youth (i.e. the limited access to micro-credit and affordable business support services) continued to hamper the initiative of young people in setting up their own business. Furthermore, the regulatory framework established for cooperatives in Kosovo regarded exclusively the agricultural sector, and a more comprehensive framework could not be negotiated with the Ministry of Trade and Industry.

The expected results of the pilot micro-credit Guarantee Fund set up by the Project did not materialize. Although this work offered the opportunity to build the capacity of experts of the MLSW, the Fund performed below expectations. This was partly due to the concerted banking practices on interest rates and collateral. The aim of the Fund was to provide full coverage for the collateral that disadvantaged young people with entrepreneurial potential would provide to bank institutions. However, the informal practice for disbursing loans requested collateral that averaged between two and three times the amount of the requested credit. The MLSW was advised that this practice could possibly be overcome through the negotiation of favourable contractual conditions on the basis of a more consistent amount of funding. In this regard and to bring to scale the Fund, the MLSW was suggested to: consider a mixed system of incentives (part grant, part credit) for prospective self-employed youth who are disadvantaged; select an institution-based guarantee system through transparent and competitive bidding; extend repayment periods; and include an advisory/mentoring system to provide assistance to beneficiaries.

OBJECTIVES ACHIEVED

Immediate objectives

The first immediate objective specified in the Project Document was “At the end of the Project, a network of three vocational training providers will be self-sustainable and delivering competency-based modular training programmes in priority occupations”.

By June 2004 - when the first phase of the Project was concluded - the four ILO-sponsored vocational training centres had provided competency-based courses to 1,609 unemployed in 27 priority occupations. From mid-2004 to September 2007, the date of the final evaluation of the Project, the network of MLSW training centres had trained more than 12,000 job seekers. Training delivery and intake of job seekers has been brought up to scale; programmes in both the MLSW-managed training centres and in partner institutions are based on competencies, follow the curricula developed under the aegis of the Project and are certified according to the vocational standards agreed upon. The adult training system is regulated by the laws designed through the contribution of the Project (on vocational education and adult training). The training system is regularly monitored and evaluated with the tools and instruments developed under the guidance of the Project. Public investment on adult training through the Kosovo Consolidated Budget increased from €1.2 million in 2003 to €3.6 million in 2006.

The second immediate objective of the Project was “The capacity of employment offices to provide vocational counselling, guidance and linkages with the labour market will have been strengthened”.

Efforts were made in assisting all the staff of the Public Employment Service in improving the delivery of services to both job seekers and employers. By mid-2004, trained staff of the Public Employment Service had counselled approximately 21,000 unemployed, while in the period July 2004-September 2007 roughly 105,000 unemployed received counselling and guidance according to the procedures designed under the aegis of the Project.

The attainment of this objective is clearly demonstrated by the constantly increasing placement rate of the Kosovo employment offices. Since 2003, when the modern counselling practices introduced by the Project started to

be mainstreamed in the PES daily workflow, the placement rate increased by 20 per cent per year, the activation rate for young people (15-24 years of age) increased by 2 per cent and the vacancy registration rate by 25 per cent annually. These results were achieved despite a constant increase in the registration rate (2-3 per cent annually), a ratio of counsellor/job seeker of 1:1,600 and shrinking human and financial resources.

The third immediate objective was “A framework for self-employment training and related measures will have been established by the end of the Project”.

Despite the delays experienced, by mid-2004 all training centres offered self-employment in their portfolio of training programmes. At the conclusion of the first part of the Project, there were eight self-employment trainers delivering both self-employment orientation courses and fully fledged programmes leading to the formulation of a business plan. Self-employment trainers were supported in making contact with advisory services and micro-credit institutions. Such work resulted in the adoption of procedures for linking training with micro-credit facilities and also in a guide listing commercial and non-commercial credit institutions, as well as advisory services available in each region. By mid-2004, 853 unemployed had received self-employment and follow-up assistance, while in the period 2004-07 approximately 1,100 persons participated in self-employment courses and produced a business plan.

The first objective of the addendum signed in 2004 on youth employment read “Youth employment policy development and coordination of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) and other government agencies, as well as the social partners, will have been strengthened by the end of the Project”.

The institutional development component of the second phase of the Project comprised the development of a combination of knowledge and tools for advocacy and services. The involvement of several stakeholders fostered a more coordinated and holistic approach to youth employment, combining the initiatives of different ministries and between central and local agencies. The project strategy also succeeded in bringing the social partners closer to the decision-making process, thus ensuring broader participation in policy and programme design.

The activities carried out on youth employment policy and the Action Plan confirmed that substantive technical support is required at the national level to address the complexity of the policy development work in terms of both its content and the underpinning process. Before the Action Plan, most members of the inter-ministerial working group had never acted together. In addition, many of them were unaware of the activities prompted by the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare with regard to youth employment and were not used to taking this issue into account in decision making within their respective ministries. Moreover, the lack of comprehensive development and/or employment policy frameworks (e.g. a national development plan, a poverty reduction strategy, an employment policy), and the existence of competing sectoral strategies further complicated the policy development process.

The second objective was “Pilot programmes aimed at enhancing employability of disadvantaged young un(der)employed will have been introduced and implemented together with government agencies and the social partners”, while the third read “Pilot programmes aimed at improving decent work opportunities for young people will have been introduced and implemented together with government agencies and the social partners”.

The pilot implementation of active labour market programmes aimed at improving the employability and employment prospects of young people at risk of labour market exclusion yielded a number of best practices and lesson learned that were mainstreamed into the formulation of the Kosovo Employment Strategy and the design of other technical cooperation projects in the field of employment.

The work addressing the identified efficiency gaps in the provision of employment and training services improved the impact of labour market institutions by providing a solid management base for up-scaling and diversifying active labour market policies and programmes. Overall, there are a number of spin-off effects that were generated by the youth employment component of the Project, including the decision of the Government to continue, with budgetary and extra-budgetary sources of funding, the implementation of ALMPs targeting disadvantaged youth.

Development objective

The development objective of the Project Document reads: “The Project aims to contribute to the reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo through the development of human resources, as well as to the establishment of a framework for adult vocational training and retraining”.

The quantitative results of this Project, which had a total duration of six years, indicate a measurable impact on the overall human resources development and employment promotion system of Kosovo. Adult training as well as employment counselling and career guidance services are now available to jobseekers through a decentralized network of vocational training centres and employment offices. The MLSW has a system for the design, monitoring and evaluation of targeted active labour market policies and programmes, as well as a policy framework for the promotion of employment and youth employment. The impact of the Project can be measured through the administrative data produced by the employment services that reports the number of job seekers placed in training and in jobs by individual characteristics. A summary of achievements of the Project’s indicators is appended as Annex V.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

Capacity of labour market institutions to deliver on employment and training policies

The Project was designed to contribute to the reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo and to assist in the transition to a market economy by integrating demand-driven, employment-oriented training into the overall recovery strategy. The Project supported the establishment of labour market institutions – the Labour and Employment Department of the Ministry of Labour, the Public Employment Service and the network of regional training institutions – and assisted the newly established authorities in setting up a vocational training system for adult unemployed and workers, in building the capacity to provide counselling, guidance and other assistance to job seekers, as well as in developing approaches for the promotion of self-employment through VET institutions and the employment services. The Project also developed the institutional capacity to design, monitor and evaluate training and employment policies and improved their effectiveness in achieving employment policy objectives.

Project activities expanded in the six years of implementation in line with the increasing labour administration competencies of the Labour and Employment Department of the MLSW. However, the relative newness of the Kosovo labour market institutions and their inexperience in tackling complex issues – increasing long-term unemployment, the low skills base of the workforce, increasing inactivity and employment in the informal economy – as well as the difficulties inherent in assigning priority to employment in instances of stagnant economic growth – suggest that further technical assistance is needed to successfully complete the reform of its labour administration.

Target groups

The Project facilitated the access of disadvantaged groups to employment and training services, especially young women living in rural areas, people with disabilities and ethnic minorities. However, the effort to promote decent work opportunities for individuals at risk of exclusion and poverty is a continuous process. While the Project succeeded in improving

employment opportunities for individuals belonging to poor households and for people with disabilities, the achievement of gender and ethnic equality in employment and training has proven somewhat elusive.

Inroads were made during the life of the Project to correct the gender gaps identified in accessing adult training courses by promoting the establishment of training programmes in gender-neutral occupational profiles. Gender concerns were also mainstreamed in the implementation of active labour market programmes. However, gender mainstreaming approaches alone proved insufficient in redressing significant employment and training gaps. Hence, the MLSW was advised to consider the establishment of affirmative policies to promote the access of women to decent employment opportunities.

The success of active employment measures targeting Roma, Egyptian and Ashkalia (RAE) and other – non-Serb – ethnic minorities was beyond expectations, while the participation of Kosovo Serbs to ALMPs was very limited, due to the increasing detachment of the Serbian community from mainstreamed Albanian-managed public services. Moreover, the non-compliance of Serbian-owned enterprises with the registration requirements in force in the UN-administered Province made it impossible for the Project to consider most of these companies eligible for ALMP participation.

Partners' commitment

Since project inception, the support of the local partners – the Ministry of Labour, social partners, managers and staff of labour market institutions – to the activities was praiseworthy. Such support allowed the Project to exceed its indicators and to achieve a high quality of project outputs.

An important strand of the Project focused on capacity-building activities benefiting the social partners, especially with regard to the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment measures. These activities focused on the collection of baseline information on working conditions of young people and their participation in trade unions, the implementation of a campaign on youth rights at work and the preparation of a statute of the Youth Network of the trade unions. A number of activities were implemented with the Chamber of Commerce to promote self-employment

among young people. These activities included the analysis of the business environment and the identification of administrative barriers that could affect self-employment opportunities for youth. This work resulted in the development of a self-employment information booklet, the opening of an information desk and a mentoring system for young entrepreneurs within the Chamber of Commerce.

Sustainability

As confirmed by the final evaluation, the impact of the Project exceeded expectations. The leverage effect from a relatively modest financial investment by the Government of Italy has been noteworthy. Moreover, the Project focus on capacity building in the partner organizations has enabled a realistic exit strategy to be enacted, with partners now able to continue with the work undertaken by the Project.

The work of the Project on youth employment, in particular, fostered policy coordination and the involvement of social partners in policy design and implementation, addressed the identified efficiency gaps in the provision of employment and vocational training services and provided a solid management base for up-scaling and diversifying active labour market policies and programmes. Such work generated a number of spin-off effects, including the decision of the Government to continue, with funding from the UNDP, the implementation of ALMPs for young unemployed at risk of labour market exclusion.

Monitoring and evaluation

The indicators of achievement contained in the Project Document were realistic, measurable and well defined. This facilitated their measurement and verification at the end of the Project. Gender issues were tracked, more so as the Project progressed beyond the first emergency reconstruction phase. Project management monitored project performance closely and had appropriate systems to do so.

The progress of the Project was internally evaluated twice. A mid-term review was carried out in February 2003, while a tripartite review was held in July 2005 to assess achievements, lessons learned and outstanding issues

relating to the youth employment phase. The final evaluation of the Project was conducted by an external, independent evaluation team in September 2007.

Social dialogue

The main goal of social dialogue is to encourage consensus building and democratic involvement among the main stakeholders in the world of work through the engagement of government institutions and employer and worker organizations. The Project pursued a close partnership with employer and worker organizations, especially in activities aimed at supporting employment creation for young people. The involvement of the social partners helped the Project shift the policy focus on issues regarding the informal economy, working conditions and workers' rights.

Conclusions

The Project was able to achieve its objectives partly because, since inception, it has upheld a clear vision and mission –the establishment of an employment and training infrastructure – that never wavered. The Project's intervention logic has been both realistic and coherent; and the implementation approach adopted allowed the Project to be flexible and thus to retain its relevance to Kosovo's needs. The Project has been successful in demonstrating how human resources development and decent work approaches can play a determinant role in promoting dialogue and fostering social inclusion, especially in a context where reconciliation and recovery processes are ongoing. The vulnerable groups identified by the Project Document— ethnic minorities, young and adult unemployed men and women –were given access to quality training and employment services. The involvement of the social partners enhanced the impact of the Project in raising awareness and building support around employment and training initiatives.

The evaluation of the Project concluded that the key features of its success revolved around: (i) its catalytic role, which resulted in other donor agencies mainstreaming their assistance within the institutional framework of the MLSW; (ii) the capacity to work with a number of ministries, agencies and donors; and (iii) the advice provided on policy and legislation,

which affected not only the Government' policy making, but also the scope of other technical cooperation projects on vocational education and training and on employment. The evaluation team also commented favourably on the cooperation and networking arrangements established by the Project that allowed it to leverage on the resources made available. This includes the ILO IPEC Project in Kosovo, but it also applies to other donors and projects – for instance, the European Agency for Reconstruction-financed Project *Technical assistance for vocational education training programme in Kosovo* and the Norwegian-financed UNDP Project on *Employment generation*.

The final evaluation of the Project considered most of the lessons learned from it were positive. The most important of these were discussed during the final Steering Committee of the Project, held in March 2008:

- *The added value of networks that link employment and training institutions and services.* Such networks allow providing integrated services, fostering jobseekers' employability and ensuring that employment and training services are targeted to the needs of individuals and to the requirements of the labour market. In addition, the availability of such networks of institutions and their experts allow the design of measures that respond to labour market requirements as well as to the needs of disadvantaged groups.
- *The importance of leveraging on knowledge and expertise of employment and training institutions.* Investment in capacity building and human resources development has been the underpinning strategy of the Project throughout its lifetime. Such strategy was instrumental to the impact and long-term sustainability of the Project. Trained staff and institutions can quickly adapt the provision of effective services to changing labour market needs.
- *The link with work experience (simulated enterprises, on-the-job training, ALMPs) and the mix theory/practice were key to ensuring high placement rates.* The design of programmes that addressed labour supply and demand simultaneously through links with the world of work was essential to improve employment outcomes of participants. It fostered the relationships of public employment and training services with enterprises, allowed a better understanding of labour

market needs and enabled the targeting of employment and training programmes.

- *The availability of broad packages of training and employment services (e.g. wage- and self-employment, vocational and non vocational skills) enhanced jobseekers' employability and broadened the avenue of labour market opportunities.* The Kosovo labour market is characterized by a rapid pace of enterprise creation and destruction. Workers are increasingly required to be adaptable and to be able to transfer their skills from one enterprise to another. The availability of a wide range of services provided workers with multiple opportunities to (re)enter the labour market and to make their career choices on the basis of a broader menu of opportunities, including the establishment of their own economic activity.
- *The need to develop methodologies and tools that are context-related and locally owned.* The value added of the Project was the development of local human resources able to design or adapt methodologies and tools to improve employment and training services. This ensured the sustainability and replicability of the reforms introduced through the Project.
- *International staff "advising" rather than "doing" is key for replicating and expanding knowledge and services.* Such an approach promoted ownership, increased local knowledge and capacity through learning-by-doing approaches and enhanced the longer-term impact of the assistance provided by the Project.
- *Communication strategies that are part of technical cooperation projects give visibility to institutions and donors, but also raise awareness on policy issues and reforms.* The use of communication strategies centred on the ILO's principles and values contributed to raise the awareness of labour market institutions, the social partners, other agencies and organizations partnering with the project – as well as the wider public – on issues such as equality of opportunities, social dialogue and decent work. Such principles have now become integral part of the policy discourse on employment promotion.
- *Both tripartite activities and needs-based assistance to employers' and workers' organizations are essential to promote social dialogue on*

employment and training. The Project worked together with the government and the social partners on the promotion of tripartism on employment issues. In parallel, it supported the strengthening of the capacity of employers' and workers' organizations to deal with the government on employment and training issues. Such approach ensured broader participation of the social partners in policy and programme development. In addition, it helped the social partners discuss a number of policy issues that were not part of the government agenda (e.g. strategies to address the informal economy, working conditions and gender equality in employment and training).

- *The formulation of appropriate and realistic objectives and performance indicators are of the essence.* The establishment of clear management and monitoring procedures and indicators was key to monitor progress, adjust activities to changing needs and to ensure Project transparency.
- *Combining technical cooperation activities with regular programmes of the ILO can only result in a win-win situation.* Technical cooperation can provide a framework for piloting innovative approaches, methodologies and tools that can be up-scaled and replicated in other contexts through ILO regular programmes. At the same time, regular programmes can support technical cooperation activities by sharing knowledge and expertise gained in other countries and regions.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations suggest action that should be taken to address the upcoming challenges in the field of labour administration and employment promotion.

- Labour market institutions in Kosovo will soon be faced with the challenge to deliver on the objectives of the employment strategy as well as to enforce the provisions of the new Labour Code and Employment Promotion Law. *Therefore, it is recommended that, upon approval, the Government of Kosovo and the Ministry of Labour develop a time-bound plan of action to implement the main pillars of the employment strategy (2008-13), namely to expand investment in human capital, ensure an inclusive labour market, and reduce the incidence of employment in the informal economy.*
- The achievement of the employment strategy objectives also requires proceeding with the reforms of the labour administration – as suggested by the ILO Project – in a timely manner. The Government of Kosovo and the Ministry of Labour are, therefore, *recommended to conduct a review of the overall labour administration system to identify priority areas of intervention, to complete the modernization process of the employment service, and to strengthen the labour inspectorate.*
- There is a need to strengthen the governance system at both the central and local levels for the implementation of the outcomes envisaged by the Youth Employment Action Plan. Such a governance system would also be instrumental in aligning the objectives set by economic and social policies – especially the development and the employment strategies – to the youth employment policy objectives. Hence, *it is recommended that the Government of Kosovo and the Ministry of Labour establish a permanent coordination and monitoring mechanism for the mid-term strategic policy framework on youth employment and the related Action Plan.*

- *It is recommended that social (territorial) pacts on youth employment be established at the regional level to facilitate the transition of broad youth employment policy objectives into concrete projects that address the needs of disadvantaged youth in different, and rapidly changing, labour markets.*
- Networks that link employment and training institutions and services have proven successful in fostering job seekers' employability and ensuring that these services are targeted to the needs of individuals and to the requirements of the labour market. *The Ministry of Labour, therefore, is recommended to continue investing in competency-based methodologies to ensure consistency of adult training approaches throughout Kosovo and to maintain flexibility and the mix of training and employment services (institution- and enterprise-based) also through targeted ALMPs.*
- As mentioned in the body of this Report, gender mainstreaming approaches can be insufficient in contexts where gender imbalances in employment and training are rather significant. *It is recommended that the Government of Kosovo develop strategies and programmes for affirmative action and gender mainstreaming in employment and skills development.*
- The monitoring system developed by the Project to measure the performance of the adult training system has offered the Ministry of Labour a tool to appraise the labour market returns of investing public funds in VET. *Hence, it is recommended that the Ministry of Labour maintain the efficiency, coherence and relevance of the current employment and training system as instrumental to its future expansion.*
- The involvement of social partners can bring into focus issues (e.g. the informal economy, working conditions, disadvantaged youth, the promotion of socially responsible enterprises) that are not always on the Government's agenda. *It is therefore recommended to invest in enhancing the technical skills of the social partners on employment and adult training issues and fully engage them in the crafting of employment and labour market policies.*
- One of the success factors of ALMPs targeting youth at risk of exclusion is the availability of baseline data detecting the main

determinants of labour market disadvantages. Hence, it is recommended that the research tools developed by the Project be continuously updated and widely disseminated (especially through more economical electronic means). This is particularly the case for the school-to-work transition instrument, which should become part of the yearly Labour Force Survey conducted by the Statistical Office of Kosovo.

- The need to carry out impact evaluations of active labour market programmes cannot be underestimated. Not only do such evaluations allow for the assessment of which programme works best and for whom, but they also provide insights into the performance of the institutions mandated to their administration and in the planning of the financial and human resource allocations necessary to achieve policy objectives. *It is therefore recommended that the Government of Kosovo and the Ministry of Labour commit human and financial resources to the development of a policy/programme monitoring and evaluation system, including the establishment of clear performance indicators.*
- The outreach capacity toward vulnerable groups built by the employment services during the Project's life needs to be maintained and nurtured. *It is recommended, therefore, that the Government of Kosovo increase the resources available for employment and training measures targeting groups that are disadvantaged and/or discriminated against in the labour market.*
- During the lifetime of the Project, useful synergies were generated with local, national and international partners. It is important that these linkages are consolidated. In this respect, *it is recommended that the Ministry of Labour make an effort to effectively coordinate technical assistance initiatives in areas within the Ministry's mandate*

Annex 2

Achievement of Project's indicators

Phase I: Skills Development

Objective 1: At the end of the project a network of three vocational training providers will be self-sustainable and delivering competency-based modular training programmes in priority occupations

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
A network of three vocational training centres established and systematically delivering training programmes to adult unemployed and workers in priority occupations	Four priority geographical areas were identified at the inception of the project although 3 were indicated in the project document. The fourth regional training institution was established because of the availability of infrastructure (facilities and partial equipment). Since 2003 the project provided technical assistance also to the 4 additional training centres handed-over by the DANIDA project to the MLSW.
A core group of 18 trainers using competency-based and flexible modular training methodologies	At the conclusion of the first phase of the project in mid 2004, the number of trainers using competency-based and flexible modular training methodologies were thirty
Developed capability to conduct competency-based modular training programmes for potential employment	The competency based training methodology was mainstreamed not only in the network of MLSW providers but also to private providers that partnered with the MLSW
Training programmes and material for 12 priority occupations available for both public and private enterprises	The overall number of priority occupations in mid 2004 was twenty-seven, each with its own set of training material and guidelines for trainers
A Training Information System developed and a data-base available;	The training material produced by trainers was collected, systematized and published for daily use in the training centres. This material also constituted the basis for the development of fully-fledged curricula in core occupations

1,500 women and men unemployed / workers trained / retrained in employment-oriented skills.	At the conclusion of the first phase of the project in mid 2004, the four training centres supported by the Project had trained 1,609 unemployed people. From mid 2004 to the time of the evaluation (September 2007) the network of MLSW training centre had trained 12,317 jobseekers.
---	---

Objective 2: The capacity of employment offices to provide vocational counselling, guidance and linkages with the labour market will have been strengthened

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
Vocational counselling and guidance methods are introduced and operational as part of the services rendered by the labour offices to their "clients";	Vocational counselling and guidance was introduced in the seven regional employment offices and twenty-three municipal employment offices. Such work resulted in the production of guidelines for PES staff in registering and counselling job seekers and in canvassing employers. Moreover, the Project produced in the local language a training package on counselling and guidance skills.
10 officials of the central and regional employment offices trained in vocational counselling and guidance and fellowships conducted;	The fellowship was conducted for 15 employment services managers and practitioners. This work resulted in the appointment of four core PES trainers responsible for training and re-training employment service staff.
At least one official in each municipal employment office is using counselling and guidance methods, as well as linking with the labour market;	All 164 counsellors and 50 registrars of the Kosovo employment services were trained in counselling and guidance techniques and use them in their daily practice.
6,000 "clients" of the labour offices have received vocational counselling and/or guidance by the end of the project;	By mid 2004 trained staff of the employment service had counselled approximately 21,000 unemployed, while in the period July 2004-September 2007 roughly 105,000 unemployed received counselling and guidance.

Objective 3: A framework for self-employment training and related measures will have been established by the end of the project.

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
Self-employment training programmes are part of the regular courses delivered by the three regional training centres;	Despite some delays on the side of the MLSW in the appointment of self-employment trainers, by mid 2004 all training centres offered in their portfolio of training courses self-employment training.
A network of self-employment resource persons is available within the three vocational training centres;	At the conclusion of the first part of the Project, there were eight self-employment trainers delivering both self-employment induction courses and fully fledged programmes lasting on average three months and leading to the formulation of a business plan.
A functional scheme for linking self-employment training with existing micro-credit facilities and/or revolving funds is agreed and adopted by training centres, employment service and credit providers;	Self-employment trainers were supported in making contact with advisory services, micro-credit institutions. Such work resulted in the adoption of procedures for linking training with micro-credit facilities and also in a guide describing commercial and non commercial credit institutions as well advisory services available in each region.
A mechanism for training follow-up assistance in terms of access to micro-credit schemes, business advisory services and business start-ups is operational and regularly provided;	In each region, self-employment trainers created their own resource networks. However, the overall number of individuals who actually receive a loan is rather small, as credit access for start-ups is difficult.
At least 500 people have received self-employment training and follow-up assistance	By mid 2004, 853 unemployed had received self-employment and follow-up assistance, while in the period 2004-2007 approximately 1,100 persons participated to self-employment courses and produced a business plan.

Phase II: Youth employment

Objective 1: Youth employment policy development and coordination of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) and other government agencies, as well as the social partners, will have been strengthened by the end of the project.

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
<p>Three training workshops are conducted and 15 participants per workshop are trained</p>	<p>The training workshops conducted by the Project for the formulation of the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan were ten (held between September 2005 and December 2006). The first workshop (induction workshop) saw the participation of eighteen participants and served to discuss the data on youth employment elaborated in the School-to-Work transition Survey. Following this first workshop, the group was divided into two sub-groups (one for labour supply and one for labour demand). The labour demand group –comprising Ministry of Labour, Education, Youth, the social partners and youth organization– met four times, while the demand side sub-group – comprising Ministry of Labour, the social partners, the Ministry of Trade, of Economy and of Agriculture met twice. The sub-groups were re-conveyed twice in early Spring 2006 to merge their work and to present preliminary findings to the Office of the Prime Ministers and to discuss further technical issues with experts from the World Bank and UNDP.</p> <p>An international fellowship was jointly organized with the International Training Centre of the ILO to refine the work carried out and to prepare the final document. A final workshop was organized in Pristina to fine-tune the costing of the Action Plan and the monitoring and evaluation mechanism. Overall 160 person/day of training were conducted.</p>

<p>Three studies for knowledge and policy development are carried out</p>	<p>The researches carried out by the project for youth employment policy development were four, namely: 1) <i>Challenges and opportunities of skills development in Kosovo: An assessment for strategy preparation</i>; 2) <i>Improving Public Employment Services in Kosovo</i>; 3) <i>Young people's transition to decent work: Evidence from Kosovo</i> and 4) <i>Country Review of the Employment Policy of the UN Administered Province of Kosovo</i></p>
<p>A youth employability strategy is drafted and approved;</p>	<p>The inter-ministerial sub-group on the labour supply side produced a youth employability strategy that was embedded in the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan.</p>
<p>A job creation strategy for young people is drafted and approved;</p>	<p>The inter-ministerial sub-group on the labour demand side produced a job creation strategy that was embedded in the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan.</p>
<p>An inter-ministerial committee on youth employment is established;</p>	<p>The inter-ministerial group on youth employment was established in March 2007 and comprised representatives of the Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Youth and Sport, Ministry of Economy and Finance, Ministry of Trade, Ministry of Agriculture and the social partners.</p>
<p>A youth employment action plan is drafted and submitted;</p>	<p>The Kosovo Youth employment action plan was formally endorsed by the PISG of Kosovo in December 2006.</p>
<p>A national conference on youth employment is conducted.</p>	<p>The conference was held in December 2006 and saw the participation of more than two hundred participants.</p>

Objective 2: Pilot programmes aimed at enhancing employability of disadvantaged young un(der)employed will have been introduced and implemented together with government agencies and the social partners.

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
A school-to-work transition survey for programme and policy development is carried out;	The school to work transition survey of Kosovo has been published in the Employment Strategy Papers (2007/4) series of the ILO with the title <i>Young people's transition to decent work: Evidence from Kosovo</i> , downloadable at http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/yett/swts.htm
Eight training workshops are conducted and 15 participants per workshop are trained;	The number of workshops carried out for the design and implementation of active labour market programmes to be financed by the Youth Employment and Training Fund were ten with an average number of 18 participants. All Regional and Municipal Employment offices' counsellors were trained in the administration of the measures as well as two trainers for each of the Regional training centres.
An employment and training fund is established and operational;	The employment and training fund started operating in June 2005. By May 2006 the fund had disbursed a total of € 290,956 (€185,160 from the ILO and €105,786 from the MLSW)
A total of 600 disadvantaged youth have participated in school-to-work programmes (apprenticeships, internships and in-company training) and 50 per cent are young women;	The total number of youth 15-24 who participated to active labour market measures were 989 (52.6 per cent men and 47.4 women).
Sixty per cent of disadvantaged youth who participated in school-to-work programmes are employed;	The placement rate of disadvantaged youth who participated in ALMPs was measured six months after the conclusion of the programme and stood at 46 per cent
The number of 2,500 jobseekers are trained by the MLSW network and participating institutions over one-year period;	The total number of jobseekers trained in the MLSW network in 2006 was of 3,455 individuals.

Seventy per cent of trainees trained by the network and participating institutions are aged 15-24;	The share of young people trained in the year 2006 was 72.3 per cent
Two sets of training material (employment counselling and self-employment for young people) are available in the local language.	The two sets of training material were published in the local language under the titles: <i>Biz-Up. Self-employment skills for young people. Facilitator's and user's guide and toolkit</i> ; and <i>Surfing the labour market: Job search skills for young people - Facilitator's and user's guide and toolkit</i> .

Objective 3: Pilot programmes aimed at improving decent work opportunities for young people will have been introduced and implemented together with government agencies and the social partners

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
Two training workshops with minimum 15 participants per workshop conducted;	The workshops organized with self-employment trainers (three) were held in July and September 2005. The first workshop regarded guarantee funds (functions and operations) and resulted in the adaptation and translation in local language of the ILO toolkit " <i>Guarantee Funds for Small Enterprises. A manual for guarantee fund managers</i> ". The second and third workshops revolved around the preparation of guidelines for the pilot guarantee fund to be established by the Project.
A set of guidelines for selecting disadvantaged youth and companies are available and used by the PES;	The guidelines prepared in Albanian and Serbian language for PES staff were not only used for project purposes, but they were mainstreamed in the design of the UNDP Employment Generation Project and are now being transformed in a set of administrative instructions of the MLSW for the design, administration and monitoring of all active labour market programmes financed by the Kosovo Consolidate budget.

<p>Employment incentives have created decent employment for 100 disadvantaged youth;</p>	<p>The total number of jobs created through employment incentives amounts to 172.</p>
<p>A guarantee fund is available and supported the creation of 100 jobs – for disadvantaged youth through enterprise development and self-employment during its first year of operation</p>	<p>This indicator failed to be achieved. The reasons for such failure were analyzed by the Project and reported to the MLSW with a set of recommendations to improve the functioning of entrepreneurship promotion programmes in Kosovo. The gaps identified by the Project revolved around the concerted banking practices on interest rates and collateral, that hampered access to commercial credit of young people.</p>

Annex 3

LIST OF POLICY AND RESEARCH PAPERS, TRAINING TOOLS AND MATERIAL DEVELOPED BY THE PROJECT

Policy Documents and research

1. Challenges and opportunities of skills development in Kosovo: An assessment for strategy preparation.
2. Improving Public Employment Services in Kosovo.
3. Vocational Education and Training for the correctional facilities of Kosovo - An ILO input to the exit strategy of the Penal Management Division of the United Nations Mission in Kosovo.
4. Gender dimensions of skills development in Kosovo.
5. Improving applied research for policy making in Kosovo – Challenges and opportunities.
6. Principle and practices of modern labour inspection.
7. Guidelines for the development of National Action Plans on youth employment (Albanian and Serbian).
8. V. Corbanese, G. Rosas, "Young people's transition to decent work: Evidence from Kosovo", ILO Geneva, Employment Policy Papers 2007/4.
9. Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan. A mid-term Policy Framework (2007-2010).
10. Country Review of the Employment Policy of the UN Administered Province of Kosovo.
11. Employment Strategy of Kosovo.
12. Law on vocational education and training (VET).
13. Law on adult training.
14. Draft bill on employment promotion.
15. Draft bill on National Qualifications Framework (NQF).
16. Backgrounder to a feasibility study on the introduction of a system for Recognition of Prior Learning.

Training Tools and Materials

17. Curricula and training packages for selected occupations.
18. The role of Public Employment Service in the changing labour market, ILO, 2001 (Albanian translation).
19. Management of training institutions. Guides and tools for administrators and practitioners.
20. Guide on Contracting Training Procedures.
21. Guidelines and Tools for Evaluating Internal and External Efficiency of Skills Development Programmes.
22. Employment Counselling and Career Guidance: Trainers' Guide for employment service personnel. Glossary of Key Terms on learning and training for work (English, Albanian and Serbian).
24. Biz-Up. Self-employment skills for young people. Facilitator's and user's guide and toolkit (Albanian and English).
25. Surfing the labour market: Job search skills for young people (Albanian and English) - Facilitator's and user's guide and toolkit.
26. Biz-up! Starting your enterprise. A to Z Directory for Youth.

Other documents and publications

27. The informal economy in Kosovo: Which role for the Trade Unions?
28. Employment and Skills development services. Brochure of the MLSW.
29. Brochures and posters of the campaign "You have rights at work" of the Youth Network of the trade unions.
30. Video (CD-ROM) Youth voices from Kosovo.
31. Kosovo, your business partner; Brochure of the Chamber of Commerce.
32. Brochure "Youth employment: A global goal, a national challenge (Albanian and Serbo-Croatian).

Annex 4

LIST OF PILOT PROJECTS

1. Active labour market programmes (ALMPs) targeting youth through contracting services.
2. Building the capacity of the staff of the Public Employment Service to develop targeted services through individual employment plans (with the UNDP).
3. Vocational Education and Training for the correctional facilities of Kosovo (with Swiss Development Cooperation–SDC).
4. Integrating people with disabilities in training and employment (Kosovo-wide).
5. Income-generating activities for people with special needs (Gjakova).
6. Carer information and guidance in schools (Kosovo-wide).
7. Guarantee fund to promote youth self-employment (Kosovo-wide).



The Project Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo (Phase I and II) was funded by the Italian Government



ministero degli affari esteri