

**Good Case Practices on Inclusion of Persons with  
Disabilities in Indonesia: opening opportunities  
towards decent work, July, 2011, Jakarta,  
Indonesia**



---

International  
Labour  
Organization

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Foreword .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations and Acronyms.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>I. Introduction .....</b>	<b>7</b>
1.1 Context of Disability .....	7
1.2 Disability in Indonesia.....	8
1.3 CSR and disability inclusion in the workplace.....	9
1.4 The business case for hiring people with disabilities and human rights .....	10
1.5 Case Studies in Indonesia.....	10
1.6 Content of the study.....	11
1.7 Methodology and outline .....	12
1.8 Challenges and issues encountered.....	13
<b>II. The Four Case Studies .....</b>	<b>14</b>
2.1 Themes explored.....	14
2.2 P.T. Indosiar Visual Mandiri.....	16
2.3 KSBSI.....	19
2.4 NVRC .....	21
2.5 Omron .....	23
<b>III. Conclusion .....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>IV. ANNEX .....</b>	<b>29</b>
1. Resources .....	29
2. Listing of Company Information and Persons Interviewed .....	30
3. Interview Questions.....	31

## **Foreword**

The World Health Organization (WHO) estimates about 15% of the world's population (seven billion persons) lives with some form of disability, of whom two to four per cent experience significant difficulties in daily functioning. This global estimate for disability is on the rise due to population ageing as well as due to more adequate definitions and data that measure disability.<sup>1</sup> While many people with disabilities are successfully employed and fully integrated in society, persons with disabilities often face disproportionate poverty and unemployment.<sup>2</sup>

Social exclusion and discrimination against persons with disabilities have been increasingly perceived as human rights issues. The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD, 2006) calls on governments to ensure that persons with disabilities are able to access education, vocational training, and lifelong learning on an equal basis with others (Art. 24, 5). This convention along with other human rights instruments such as ILO Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), and ILO Rehabilitation and Vocational Training (Disabled People) Convention, 1983 (No. 159) work to ensure the goal of inclusion and full participation for persons with disabilities in society the world over. However, in the Asia-Pacific region and in Indonesia in particular, there is still work to be done. While Indonesia has signed the UNCRPD, created a National Plan of Action for the Measure of Social Welfare Enhancement for Indonesia's People with Disabilities (2004-2013), and ratified ILO Convention No. 111, it has yet to ratify ILO Convention No. 159. Indonesia has a quota provision (Law No.4/1997 and Regulation No. 43/98)<sup>3</sup>, yet, at the same time, access to decent work options for youth, and people with disabilities remains limited.

Decent work is the ILO's primary goal for everyone, including persons with disabilities, based on the principles of equal opportunity, equal treatment, mainstreaming into vocational rehabilitation and employment services

---

<sup>1</sup>World Health Organization and World Bank. (2011). *World Report on Disability 2011*. Geneva. Retrieved on June 29, 2011 from: [http://www.who.int/disabilities/world\\_report/2011/report/en/index.html](http://www.who.int/disabilities/world_report/2011/report/en/index.html)

<sup>2</sup> ILO Skills and Employability. 2011. Retrieved 09.20.2011 from: <http://www.ilo.org/skills/areas/inclusion-of-persons-with-disabilities/lang--en/index.htm>

<sup>3</sup> Act of the Republic of Indonesia Number 4 concerning Disabled People, 1997 and Government Regulation No. 43/1998 on the Promotion of Welfare of Persons with Disabilities.

programmes, and community involvement. The ILO over the years has continuously engaged with employers' organisations and trade unions to promote equal opportunities in the workplace, and has developed the ILO Global Business and Disability Network consisting of multi-national corporations (MNCs), existing employer and business networks on disability, and representatives of disabled persons' organizations (DPOs) to assist companies to integrate disability into the workplace and their strategic business plans. The ILO believes that by participating in such a network and knowledge-sharing and capacity-building activities, companies will benefit from more diverse workforces, improved productivity, reduced turnover, safer workplaces and increased customer and community brand loyalty.

The following case studies were prepared for an Indonesian National Multi-stakeholder Workshop on, which took place July 25-26, 2011 in Jakarta and can obviously contribute to the existing database of the ILO Global Business and Disability Network.

## **List of Abbreviations and Acronyms**

CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
DPOs	Disabled Peoples' Organizations
KSBSI	Konfererasi Serikat Buruh Sejahtera (National Prosperity Trade Union Confederation)
MNCs	Multi-national corporations
MoMT	Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration
MoSA	Ministry of Social Affairs
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NVRC	National Vocational Rehabilitation Centre
UNCRPD	United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

## **Executive Summary**

The ILO promotes decent work for *all* persons, including persons with disabilities, using a rights based approach founded on principles of equal opportunity, equal treatment and non-discrimination. In line with the UNCRPD, ILO Conventions No. 111 and No. 159 also act as human rights instruments in promoting the right to decent work for persons with disabilities.

Diversity in the workforce and disability inclusion is increasingly coming to the attention of employers and employers' organisations, trade unions, MNCs, and government-run entities. In Indonesia, disability inclusion and the mainstreaming of disability issues are still in the beginning stages. While certain first steps have been taken regarding inclusion in the workforce, critical issues to be addressed in Indonesia are accountability, policy coherence and implementation, access to employment, recruitment, skills training, assessments, and vocational educational opportunities for persons with disabilities.

The following four case studies highlight P.T. Indosiar, KSBSI, NVRC, and P.T. Omrons' positive steps towards disability inclusion in the workforce in Indonesia, and were conducted as an input to the National Workshop on disability inclusion held in Jakarta, Indonesia on July 25-26, 2011.

The case study findings indicate increasing interest of companies to promote diversity and disability inclusion in the workplace through Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR), and the business case for hiring persons with disabilities. In addition it was found that there is a need for deeper understanding of the policies and legislation regarding the hiring of persons with disabilities, and how to best approach mainstreaming disability in the workforce. Policy development know-how, ensuring accessibility, and training enterprise staff to work with people with disabilities are priority areas which can most effectively be addressed through strong partnerships between government, enterprises, and DPOs as technical resources are critical for any intervention to be successful. Finally, the cases indicate that governments should more proactively support companies in implementing

disability inclusion through services that identify people with disabilities, provide placement and training services, and link DPOs with the respective companies.

We hope that the readers will find inspiration and insights from the experiences and examples highlighted. We wish to express our thanks to those companies and organizations involved in the study. They are especially acknowledged for sharing their experiences and taking the time to work with the ILO, as well as presenting workshop.

## **I. Introduction**

Decent work is the ILO's primary goal for everyone, including persons with disabilities. The ILO has worked for over 50 years to promote skills development and employment opportunities for people with disabilities and to mainstream disability into vocational rehabilitation and employment services programmes and community involvement. The principle of non-discrimination is increasingly emphasized as disability issues have come to be seen as human rights issues. The ILO works to achieve this goal through promoting labour standards, advocacy, knowledge-building on the training and employment of people with disabilities and technical cooperation services and partnerships. The ILO over the years has continuously engaged with employers' organisations and trade unions to promote equal opportunities in the workplace. The following case studies feature organizations and business which are actively participating in the promotion of equal opportunities and training for persons with disabilities in the world of work.

### **1.1 Context of Disability**

Historically, people with disabilities have been among the most economically impoverished, politically marginalized, and least visible members of society. According to UN statistics 82 per cent of disabled people in developing countries live below the poverty line, and are among the most vulnerable and marginalized in these countries; an estimated 20 per cent of all persons with disabilities live on less than one US Dollar per day.<sup>4</sup>

Many reports indicate that unemployment among the world's disabled people of working age is far higher than for working-age individuals, with rates of up to 80 per cent reported in some countries.<sup>5</sup> Often, persons with disabilities who want to work lack the opportunity due to political, social, and economic barriers, including limited opportunities for education and skills development. In some countries throughout the world, economic growth has led to increased employment opportunities. Consequently, in many of these countries, *some* people with disabilities are

---

<sup>4</sup> O'Reilly. 2007. The right to decent work for persons with disabilities. (ILO, Geneva).

<sup>5</sup> Reported unemployment rates vary from 13 per cent in the United Kingdom, a rate which is twice that of the non-disabled workforce, to 18 per cent in Germany, to an estimated 80 per cent and more in many developing countries.

participating and contributing in the world of work. As persons with disabilities participate in employment, and vocational and training programmes, it is increasingly apparent that disabled people not only have a valuable contribution to make to the national economy but that their employment may reduce poverty. This realization supports the strong business case for employing people with disabilities, and be explored further in this study. Employers may also gain by expanding the number of eligible workers through continuing the employment of those who become disabled on the job, as valuable expertise acquired on the job and through work related training is retained.

Many organizations and their networks – including employers’ and workers’ organizations, and organizations of persons with disabilities – are contributing to facilitating the employment, job retention and return-to-work opportunities for disabled persons. Measures adopted by these organizations include policies and programmes and provision of advisory and supportive services. Governments play an essential role in creating a supportive legislative and social policy environment and in providing incentives to ensure accessibility and promote employment opportunities for people with disabilities. Moreover, the participation and initiative of people with disabilities is important for their equal participation in the workplace.

## **1.2 Disability in Indonesia**

In recent years, the Asia and Pacific region has made significant strides in recognizing disability as a human rights issue, and in addressing the challenges that people with disabilities face in their efforts to contribute economically, socially, and politically to their societies. Indonesia’s progress on the inclusion of persons with disabilities can be attributed to measures taken such as signing the UNCPRD, creating the National Plan of Action, and ratification of ILO Convention No. 111.

Indonesia’s MoSA heads an interagency working group in efforts to mainstream disability, as evidenced in the creation of the National Plan of Action. Much of the existing data on the current situation of persons with disabilities in Indonesia is not easily accessible. Lack of data collection and follow-up make it difficult to assess the situation for people with disabilities and their employment outcomes beyond those

formally enrolled in services. However, the Government is interested in developing its job placement services and to provide services for those who participate in the informal economy or who will become self-employed, as well as developing a centralized system for registering job seekers and jobs available to persons and youth with disabilities. The MoSA and the MoMT have expressed the importance to improve the data on persons with disabilities and to implement the current quota system.<sup>6</sup>

### **1.3 CSR and disability inclusion in the workplace**

Currently many companies realize that persons with disabilities are productive, reliable employees who bring benefits to the workplace and want to practice a culture of diversity, which is important in the promotion of good business practices. Some companies, as a part of CSR, also engage in developing products and services for people with disabilities, their families and friends. In addition, as companies engage with communities in which they work, many pay specific attention to persons with disabilities.

National governments, recognizing the barriers to socio-economic participation that disabled persons face, have enacted legislation related to unequal access to decent work. The UNCRPD (2006) is a comprehensive human rights Convention related to persons with disabilities requiring changes in national policies and practices. Countries have responded by changing and updating laws to comply with UNCRPD provisions, as it has specific implications for employers and businesses. At the same time, human rights issues, CSR, and the business case for hiring people with disabilities are also becoming increasingly well known. In several parts of the world, national and regional networks of employers have been formed to address diversity issues and disability in particular. The ILO promotes CSR and has conducted international studies profiling good practices on disability inclusion in the workplace.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> Act of the Republic of Indonesia Number 4 concerning Disabled People, 1997 and Government Regulation No. 43/1998 on the Promotion of Welfare of Persons with Disabilities.

<sup>7</sup> ILO. 2010. *Disability in the Workplace: Company Practices*. Retrieved 29.08.2011 from: ([http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/actemp/downloads/publications/working\\_paper\\_n3.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/actemp/downloads/publications/working_paper_n3.pdf))

## 1.4 The business case for hiring people with disabilities and human rights

Companies hire people with disabilities and address their needs in products and services as well as CSR initiatives for many reasons. A reason behind hiring persons with disabilities can be attributed to the business case. Based on an emerging body of information, the business case outlines the benefits of a diverse workforce, inclusive of disabled persons. Key points are as follows:

- People with disabilities make good, dependable employees. Many cases document comparable productivity, lower accident rates and higher job retention rates between employees with disabilities and a company's general workforce.
- People with disabilities represent an untapped source of skills and talent, including technical skills if they have access to training, and transferable problem-solving skills developed in daily life. People who develop disabilities while working often have valuable skills and experiences learned on the job, in addition to their formal skills qualifications.
- Disabled people, their families, and friends, are often an overlooked market segment. Especially in developed countries, many have significant disposable income.
- Hiring people with disabilities can contribute to the overall diversity, creativity, and workplace morale, and enhance a company's image among its staff, in the community, and among customers.<sup>8</sup>

Many of the company profiles in *Disability in the Workplace* illustrate ILO principles including those articulated in the *ILO Code of Practice on managing disability in the workplace*<sup>9</sup> and in ILO standards. They also provide inspiration and guidance for companies on advancing their non-discrimination and diversity policies and initiatives, especially in light of legislative frameworks that are being amended as a result of the UNCRPD.

## 1.5 Case Studies in Indonesia

Earlier studies on disabilities in Indonesia have looked at inclusive education and ways to provide improved disaster response for persons with disabilities, while a

---

<sup>8</sup> ILO. 2011. *Disability in the Workplace and the ILO Global Business and Disability Network*. Prepared for the ILO-UN Global Compact Webinar. 29.06.2011. Retrieved 29.08.2011 from: [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed\\_emp/@emp\\_ent/@multi/documents/meetingdocument/wcms\\_159137.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@emp_ent/@multi/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_159137.pdf)  
<sup>9</sup>ILO.2001. *ILO Code of Practice on Managing Disability in the Workplace*. Geneva. Retrieved on 29.08.2011 from: <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/relm/gb/docs/gb282/pdf/tmemdw-2.pdf>

recent study by AusAID looks at the barriers to access to justice for persons with disabilities.<sup>10,11</sup>

This study responds to a growing body of empirical proof that supports the business case for hiring people with disabilities and the interest of companies to maintain diverse workforces. Each case study looks at critical aspects of inclusion by doing on-site visits to view accommodations for persons with disabilities, such as the provision of assistive or modified devices, and looking at the physical built environment. Other aspects are concerned with the recruitment, retention, and skills training needs of persons with disabilities and whether there are written policies regarding discrimination and the hiring of disabled persons. Trade unions are asked about assistance with social protection and negotiations with employers so that their members who were hurt on the job can come back to work or receive compensation. Persons with disabilities were interviewed on site and asked about improved quality of life and acceptance at the workplace.

It is the hope that in the future more information on other organizations and businesses in Indonesia will be available due to increased participation in CSR and the inclusion of persons with disabilities in the workplace.

## **1.6 Content of the study**

As Indonesia strives to take disability inclusion past the beginning stage, its challenge at the strategic level will be to provide an enabling and inclusive environment, which ensures effective implementation of policies and programmes and policy coherence so that youth and persons with disabilities can obtain equal access to education, skill development, and the labour market.<sup>12</sup> A range of work options and emerging models of employment such as supported employment and social enterprises could be viable options for Indonesia.

---

<sup>10</sup> Colbran, N. (2010) *Access to Justice Persons with Disabilities*. AusAid. Retrieved on 29.08.2011 from: <http://www.iaca.web.id/attachments/article/29/VI%20B%20Nicole%20Colebran.pdf>

<sup>11</sup> UNESCO. (2008). *Country Report Indonesia: Indonesian Public Policies on Inclusive Education*. Retrieved 28.08.2011 from: [http://www.ibe.unesco.org/National\\_Reports/ICE\\_2008/indonesia\\_NR08.pdf](http://www.ibe.unesco.org/National_Reports/ICE_2008/indonesia_NR08.pdf) and Priestley, M. and Hemingway, L. (2007) Disability and disaster recovery: a tale of two cities? *Journal of Social Work in Disability & Rehabilitation*, 5 (3-4). pp. 23-42.

<sup>12</sup> ILO-Jakarta. (March 2010) Concept Note: PROMOTING DECENT WORK FOR YOUNG WOMEN AND MEN WITH DISABILITIES IN INDONESIA THROUGH AN INCLUSIVE APPROACH TO VOCATIONAL TRAINING AND EQUAL ACCESS TO THE LABOUR MARKET: A TOURISM SECTOR INITIATIVE IN EAST JAVA AND BALI

This study was prepared by the ILO as a resource for participants of the workshop conducted in July 2011 jointly by the ILO, AusAID, and the line ministries of Indonesia in supporting decent work for people with disabilities.

The purpose of the case studies was to provide insight on what some MNCs, national industries, government entities, and Trade Unions are currently doing with regard to disability in Indonesia. Each profile briefly describes the context of operations as it relates to the issue of disability and practices toward disabled persons. It asks interviewees about the company's experiences with employees with disabilities, about perceptions of managers, supervisors, and non-disabled employees, and inquires about the benefits of hiring a person with a disability, both to the company and to the person with a disability. Vignettes feature disabled employees and recipients of disability services. As countries are ratifying and seeking to implement the UNCRPD, these stories can provide inspiration and guidance.

## **1.7 Methodology and outline**

Each profile represents a self-report of the company's activities, and thus should not be seen as an independent analysis. In most cases, the information-gathering process began with phone interviews followed by a site visit, whereby company representatives were consulted to learn more and to clarify certain points. Because the methodology was based on company reports, the information is not fully consistent across all profiles. However, the profiles illustrate the practices different companies and organizations use to attract, retain and accommodate disabled persons in the workplace, to develop products and services that address the needs of disabled persons, and to support them in the communities.<sup>13</sup> Some entities interviewed also provided written material about their guiding principles or policies regarding non-discrimination and employees with disabilities.

We hope that the readers will find inspiration and insights from the experiences and examples highlighted. We wish to express our thanks to those companies and

---

<sup>13</sup> See questionnaire template used during interviewing in the Appendix. Note not all questions were relevant for each company or organization, therefore some of the questions were changed or omitted (such as in the example with the Trade Union).

organizations involved in the study. They are especially acknowledged for sharing their experiences and taking the time to work with the ILO, as well as presenting at the workshop.

## 1.8 Challenges and issues encountered

Many of the concerns of the entities interviewed echoed those of other organizations and businesses around the globe regarding inclusion of persons with disabilities in the workforce. Most notably was a lack of information on where “to find” persons with disabilities and how to attract them as potential employees. Employers were also concerned with skills needs and qualifications, and budgetary concerns to improve existing infrastructure to provide a more disability friendly and safe environment for workers. Noted were that communication was an issue for some entities (with deaf staff, for example)

### Key Findings:

- **Accessing people with disabilities is a challenge**
- **The skills and qualifications of people with disabilities are often unknown**
- **There is a strong need for enterprises to know how to develop and implement policies for their own training needs**

and training needs assessments could be improved upon and modified to ensure the efficient productivity of businesses with employees with disabilities. Trade unions were concerned with compliance of businesses to assist their workers who became disabled on the job either through compensation or in transitioning back to work. It was noted that *none* of the entities interviewed provided special training on disability in the workplace to their managers, supervisors, or employees (disabled and non-disabled alike), which could be beneficial to overall moral, acceptance and attitude towards, and comprehension of the needs of persons with disabilities. Such trainings could be done in partnership with local DPOs and organizations that work on behalf of persons with disabilities, and could include short sign language sessions, or information on the best way to set up a work space and equipment for disabled workers. Employees with disabilities are empowered by participating and when they are involved in decisions concerning their needs and capabilities.

## II. The Four Case Studies

This study looks at positive strides toward inclusion of persons with disabilities in the workplace and the promotion of equal opportunities, specifically in Indonesia. It looks at thematic areas, and features short vignettes of employees with disabilities. Persons interviewed were employees with disabilities, their managers and supervisors, organizational directors, executive officers, other staff on site, and trade union leaders.

Featured Cases:

1. P.T. Indosiar Visual Mandiri
2. Indonesia Prosperity Trade Union Confederation (KSBSI)
3. National Vocational Rehabilitation Centre (NVRC)
4. PT Omron Manufacturing of Indonesia

### 2.1 Themes explored

Interviews focused on a short description of each entity, regarding type of organization, function, and description of employees or clients with disabilities. Further probing asked about **internal operations** and what motivated companies to hire people with disabilities, how they got started, and any benefits experienced as a result of hiring people with disabilities. Companies were selected based on overall achievement, recognition by the government, recommendations from DPOs, and inquiry of employers' organizations.

Thematic areas investigated were **practices to promote the training, hiring or retention of disabled persons and their productivity**, including how disabled job applicants were found and sourced, changes to the physical work environment made to accommodate disabled persons, and any associated costs.

**Policies and written material** regarding non-discrimination practices and other concerns regarding persons with disabilities were explored but were found to be inconsistent across all agencies and an area of concern. The ILO has provided much technical assistance in this area and could be a relevant cooperation partner.

Consultants looked at **perceptions of managers and supervisors** on site, and what they had to say about the productivity of disabled workers, and what benefits and challenges they perceived as a result of hiring people with disabilities. The recurring theme regarding changed and improved perceptions of staff and others as a result of hiring workers with disabilities was evidenced throughout the study by the positive feedback shared by all.

Stories and personal interviews with disabled employees indicated positive **changes in livelihood and economic security**, with an overall improvement in functioning with a disability and quality of life. More than once it was mentioned that disabled workers would tell their friends and family about their positive experiences and would recommend the company/organization to other persons with disabilities, family members and friends.

Finally, the local trade union KSBSI discussed their keen **desire to be more active in the promotion of inclusion of persons with disabilities** in the workplace and in the recruitment of members with disabilities. Further **technical assistance on approaching disability inclusion** is needed, as well as how to negotiate with employers on behalf of persons with disabilities in returning to work after an accident, for example.

This study finds that although disability inclusion in the workplace has taken positive strides over the past 10-15 years in Indonesia, there is room for improvement regarding CSR, practices promoting disability inclusion, capacity building, and the creation of relevant policies on work practices involving persons with disabilities. Hence, the need is to promote partnerships and collaborative practices with others to realize CSR disability inclusion goals. Collaborative practice starting points begin with NGOs and include increasing involvement from the

**Box 2: Priority areas:**

- Promotion of partnerships between government, NGOs/DPOs and Enterprises is critical
- Accessibility standards
- Placement services
- Proactive inclusive and non-discriminatory vacancy announcements

government. DPOs can provide disability awareness training and assist in capacity building, as well as advising on accessibility and product development. Further areas for development should address adherence to accessibility standards in the physical built environment, and eventually on-line web-based accessibility, which is the result of improved technology and information systems and standards. Active promotion of such standards is imperative. Finally, participation in business groups and networks with clear lines of communication is a means of support and provides opportunities for learning. The ILO's Global Business and Disability Network could be a starting point for these organizations.

## **2.2 P.T. Indosiar Visual Mandiri**

### **Company overview**

PT Indosiar Kary Media TBK is Indonesia's national television broadcasting station established in 1991, developing into an operating parent company of the television broadcast business in Indonesia. The company has made strategic steps to spark greater potency of sustainable growth, including hiring persons with disabilities. Indosiar began this practice two years before the quota provision Law No. 4/1997. Indosiar has over 1,200 employees of which 31 are persons with disabilities. At least three employees have been at Indosiar for over 15 years and most have been at Indosiar for over five years, which is an indication that Indosiar receives positive feedback and referrals from its disabled employees. Persons with physical disabilities, visual impairments, or who are deaf are in almost every department including public relations, photography, administration, information technology, marketing, engineering, and in the News Department as journalists, librarians, and in production.

### **Motivational factors behind gaining disability experience**

Indosiar's management discussed the improved productivity and moral of staff as a result of employing persons with disabilities. In particular disabled employees' loyalty to the company acted as a motivation in their recruitment and hiring of people with disabilities. Indosiar's CSR efforts are based on giving equal opportunity to *all* persons and acknowledge that employees with disabilities are good workers,

very productive, and that the company has more credibility by hiring them. As is the case with some other businesses who hire persons with disabilities, the perceptions of non-disabled staff regarding their disabled counterparts initially carried a negative stigma. Disabled employees *proved* that they worked on an equal basis by working hard and efficiently, which helped shift attitudes of co-workers and staff. While Indosiar does not engage in any special training related to hiring or managing employees with disabilities, they have collaborated with a local DPO by sending an employee with disabilities to a training conducted by the organization. Building on this established relationship could benefit Indosiar by using the opportunity to build capacity of *all* their staff and managers, including employees with disabilities, through disability awareness trainings and activities. The ILO encourages such partnerships and collaborative practices which create independence and sustainability.

### **Recruitment, accommodations, and adaptations**

Finding applicants with the appropriate skills needed for positions is a barrier faced by many employers and is a difficult task to approach if applicant pools are low. Indosiar could benefit from improved recruitment and advertising practices, as most of their applicants came by word of mouth. Indosiar's advertisements do not make special announcements focused at persons with disabilities, and seldom use the internet or national job service centres. One such recommendation is that business use the words "Persons with disabilities are encouraged to apply." in their advertising campaigns, which not only openly invites applications from disabled people, but signifies to the community the organization's stance on equal employment and non-discriminatory practices. This practice is used frequently in more developed countries, and looks good for business. Indosiar's hiring process treats all applicants equally. If the person is hired, then he or she will be on probation for three months and permanently hired if there were no problems during that time. Indosiar has taken small measures to improve upon the built environment. These adaptations were low in cost but had great benefit to their disabled workers. The building itself is accessible to persons with physical disabilities, with ramps and bars in the bathroom areas. They are in the process of setting up a computer program for persons who are blind, and also provide a car to

pick up and deliver all night shift employees (regardless of having a disability) to ensure safety.

### **Policies and written material**

Indosiar recognizes quality human resources are its main asset and solid teamwork is the key to its success, and therefore commits to maintain a working environment which provides opportunities for staff development. This policy results in high employee loyalty, as reflected by long years of employment since its inception, as many as 758 persons or 48% of the total employees are those who have been working for more than 10 years. Although Indosiar does not have a written policy on the hiring of persons with disabilities or a discrimination policy; it is in line the Ministry of Manpower-Decision No. 205/MEN/1999 concerning Job Training and Placement for the Disabled. Indosiar opened opportunities for students with disabilities from the National Vocational Rehabilitation Centre (NVRC) by offering apprenticeship programmes.

### **Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)**

Indosiar bears a huge responsibility in implementing its mission as one of television media's largest companies in Indonesia. The power of television media to spread information to the community rapidly and effectively has been utilized by Indosiar in their CSR activities to collect aid from the public and distribute it to those most in need. Further efforts include earthquake and flood relief to deliver food, clothing, and building materials to those affected by the natural disasters. In addition, Indosiar was recognized by the MOSA and MoMT in hiring above and beyond the one per cent quota (Law No. 4/1997).

### **Management perception**

Managers at Indosiar have good things to say about their employees with disabilities, noting they have not had any problems in 16 years. Productivity of their disabled employees at times surpassed those who are non-disabled, and they again mentioned loyalty and low turnover of employees with disabilities as contributing to a positive outlook on disability inclusion.

### **Featured story Maria**

Maria works as a telephone operator at Indosiar, is 31 years old and has a visual impairment. She arrives at work by public bus, the same as many other employees. Her disability does not interfere with her work answering and directing phone calls, which she learned by doing. Maria's quality of life and disability functioning have greatly improved now that she is working at Indosiar and earning a salary. Technology has played an important role in her life, as she uses an accessible computer with a screen reader specifically designed for persons with visual impairments, and an accessible cell phone which uses voice recognition technology. Since starting at Indosiar she is able to afford the technology, which eases her disability functioning.

## **2.3 KSBSI**

### **Indonesia Prosperity Trade Union Confederation (Konfererasi Serikat Buruh Sejahtera Indonesia)**

#### **Trade Union overview**

The role of Indonesia's Trade Union KSBSI is to provide collective bargaining between the government and their formal and informal worker members around issues such as the right to work, compliance with labour standards, and workers' compensation. In Indonesia, employers and employees pay into a government social protection fund, which covers death, health, accident, and old age insurance. Although both employees and employers contribute to the fund, employers usually pay more. Social Security is beneficial for workers, as they are insured should they have an accident at the work place or on the way home from work. Through negotiations between the KSBSI and the government, "informal workers", such as motorcycle taxi drivers can also receive accident and death insurance. KSBSI collects dues from these workers on their behalf for social protection, and helps persons who have been in accidents go back to work.

#### **Services and action**

Up to this point KSBSI has had little involvement in disability issues, yet sees its role in negotiation on behalf of workers who have been injured. They suggested that they

could create a ruling for the trade union on this subject, but need more information from the ministries on how they can become more involved. Communication amongst all stakeholders including Union representatives, workers, employers, and the government should be addressed, as well as capacity building measures. The government's role is to effectively provide information about their rehabilitation and skills training programmes related to persons with disabilities, whereby KSBSI could assist their members with disabilities and become more involved to help them understand both their labour and human rights. Options for persons with disabilities could be to go back to work or to join entrepreneur programmes. Through discussion and support, the government and employers could improve upon rehabilitation centres' services in addressing the rehabilitation needs of employees who are injured on the job.

KSBSI is fighting politically for the one per cent quota law (Law No. 4/1997) regarding inclusion of persons with disabilities at the workplace. Previously, their attention was focused on engaging women and youth whereby they conducted outreach activities in places where young people gather (such as in malls, coffee shops, and universities). Such gatherings can provide opportunities to promote awareness regarding youth with disabilities by focusing on inclusion and mainstreaming. The ILO promotes opportunities for youth and youth with disabilities via trade union involvement, and encourages local chapters to seek out technical assistance to build their capacities. Disabled and non-disabled youth alike could benefit from the services that trade unions have to offer.

**Featured story: Trade Union assistance in case of employer refusal to pay for worker injured on the job**

A driver for a shipping company was in an accident while on the job driving to another province, whereby his leg was broken as a result. As the driver was not formally employed and was not a union member, he was not covered by Social Security. His employer refused to bear the cost of treatment or pay the driver's sick pay, while he was unable to come into work. A KSBSI leader is currently assisting the driver to help restore his rights and with retribution. The case is now in the process of mediation between the company and the driver and the KSBSI leader, and

includes the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration at the district level. It is the hopes of KSBSI the case will be in favour of the injured worker, will set a precedent, and be an inspiration to other injured workers.

## **2.4 NVRC**

### **National Vocational Rehabilitation Centre Balai Besar Rehabilitasi Vokasional Bina Daksa (BBRVBD)**

#### **Centre overview**

The Ministry of Social Affairs (MoSA) has committed to improve the rights, dignity and participation of persons with disabilities, and promotes inclusions in society through rehabilitation and education. The National Vocational Rehabilitation Centre (NVRC) was established in 1997 with the assistance of the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA). The existence of rehabilitation services and institutions for persons with disabilities, such as the national and regional rehabilitation centre, plays an important role in supporting the effort for improving the social welfare of persons with disabilities in Indonesia.

#### **Recipients and organization**

The NVRC serves over 120 clients between the ages of 18-30 years with physical or speech and hearing impairments, yet, does not cater to persons who are blind or who have mental disabilities. By separating the two units, there is an uncertainty regarding the responsibilities of each, their capabilities, assistance, and budgets and financing. Limited budget is an issue faced by the centre, attesting to serving only 120 persons, and contributes to the lack in updating their out-dated facilities and curriculum. Currently there is a movement by the MoMT to train teachers and trainers and provide capacity building so that the centre is better prepared to take over the project.

Understanding of the barriers to employment of persons with disabilities is a key factor in improving inclusion in the workforce. Many employers do not understand their obligations regarding hiring persons with disabilities; while at the same time, the employers who *do* hire persons with disabilities are pleased with their

performance, note their loyalty, and are enthusiastic to hire additional workers with disabilities. This theme occurs consistently across all the entities interviewed, and includes mention that disabled employees are often more productive than their non-disabled co-workers.

### **Concern and action**

An important concern of the NVRC refers to Law No. 4/1997 whereby the quota and employment of persons with disabilities which can be interpreted as “flexible”. There is no power to reinforce the regulation even though there is a governing body with police partners, who have little involvement. Transparency, follow-up, and strong partnerships are extremely important to effectively implement the quota system. A partnership with the employers’ organization APINDO could be seen as a viable way to monitor implementation.

### **Recruitment**

The NVRC provides many referrals to foreign companies who are promoting diversity in the workforce (such as Omron in the following case story). All recruits receive equal treatment. Although the NVRC contacts the Chamber of Commerce to find companies in need of workers, they do not have an effective system or enough staff to address creating a pool of recruitments, nor what jobs are needed in surrounding areas. Therefore, a disconnect exists between finding the employers who need trainees and workers. Disabled job seekers can receive information from their local office under the MoSA in their districts, register, and be given an assessment, but often this is limited. Persons with disabilities are faced with transportation and accessibility issues with the centres themselves. The local market has difficulty absorbing persons with disabilities which is another problem.

### **Placement of trainees with disabilities and adaptations**

Accessibility issues and employer knowledge are obstacles which should be addressed when considering placement of trainees with disabilities. Often employers are willing to hire persons with disabilities, but have limited experience and need assistance in this area. Through improved partnerships combined with knowledge regarding the rights of persons with disabilities and the responsibilities

of employers, this obstacle could be overcome. Good practices from one company can be spread to others via networks and open communication.

Staff at chosen job sites often do not see the value of hiring a person with a disability. Negative perceptions of staff were experienced by some trainees who were placed in businesses. Seeing the productivity of the trainees with disabilities and recognizing the similarities they both share on a basic human level helped to ease negativity and attitude barriers. This presents itself as a good opportunity to provide a brief introductory training on disability to the potential job site, which could easily be done by trainers from the NVRC, or in partnerships with DPOs.

### **Trainees with disabilities**

Upon visiting the centre, ILO representatives were able to see the many different training options available, chat with students, and observe them working. Instructors commented on how engaged the students were and their dedication to their studies. Students were more than happy to pose for photos and explain their work. Graphic design students composed their ideas on the computer and displayed the silk screen T-shirts on which their designs were printed. Some students were busy testing small motors, while others learned the tools of the trade for the garment industry. Most students and trainees met were pleased with the program and looking forward to beginning work, and making a living. One trainee said he had friends whom had been through the NVRC program who received placement. They reported back how much more economically stable their lives were, and the satisfaction found in their new careers. Persons with disabilities echoed this theme throughout the study. Providing equal skills training and employment opportunities for persons with disabilities showed an increase in income, stability, and ease of disability functioning for those interviewed.

## **2.5 Omron**

### **Company overview**

Omron Manufacturing of Indonesia, in affiliation with Omron Corporation Japan, was established in 1992 and is a developer of leading-edge electronic components ranging from sensors, relays, switches, controllers and connectors. Omron

components are created for a wide array of office and telecommunications equipment as well as consumer electronics.

### **Core values and principles**

Omron realizes that in recent years, the values that society demands of companies have changed significantly. Social values are increasingly important as indicators in determining the extent a company fulfils its social responsibilities, and in what manner they contribute to society. Omron's scope and diversity provide it the opportunity to participate as a global community member through engaging in activities which benefit society, and has established its core values on this idea. Omron's management principle respects individuals' differences as it encourages societal growth and potential. This principal easily translates into better and improved opportunities for persons with disabilities both at the workplace and in society at large.

### **Motivational factors behind gaining disability experience**

Omron is pleased to note that it has 2,100 employees of whom 85% are women and 35% of Omron managers are women. In addition, 2% of their employees have disabilities, which is about 35-40 persons. Their motivation to hire persons with disabilities is based on their core values and principles of equality and non-discrimination. All of Omron's employees with disabilities have either mobility disabilities or are deaf; however, none of the managers at Omron use sign language to communicate with their deaf employees. Omron could effectively improve its training and management of its deaf employees with the use of sign language communication. Not only would this reduce the communication barrier, their deaf employees could benefit by richer explanations, learning opportunities, and praise for a job well done. Again, partnerships with local DPOs could assist Omron and their deaf employees by giving short trainings to Managers or team leaders or offering interpreting services for new hires during orientation and on the job training. These types of trainings could also be extended to include disability in general, and to regular staff and employees.

### **Recruitment and adaptations**

Omron sources many of its employees with disabilities through the National Vocational Rehabilitation Centre (NVRC, featured above). Their representatives go to the NVRC and explain what types of basic skills they are looking for, whereby the students are trained and given apprenticeships and jobs with the company after passing their basic skills assessments.

Omron has yet to make built environment adaptations such as accessible bathrooms or walkways which are smooth (i.e. cement instead of gravel). Businesses often note budget as a reason behind lack of accommodations. However, it has been found that often the cost is minimal.<sup>14</sup> Providing accommodations can be as easy as placing a block of wood underneath a table to allow for a wheelchair to fit underneath, or more complicated like widening a door. However, it is important to get input from employees with disabilities when making decisions concerning their needs. Omron recognizes this and is currently taking into consideration a request by an employee for cement pathways between buildings as the employee has a mobility disability.

### **Management and supervisor inputs**

Omron easily integrates their employees with disabilities into the workforce as most have been trained at the NVCR. Skills training for people with disabilities matched production demand by knowing in advance what type of skills businesses are looking for. Again, as noted in the previous cases, Managers were pleased with their employees with disabilities, said they were highly motivated, and that they inspired and motivated others as well.

### **Featured employees**

Interviews with Omron employees with disabilities Kusmiadi, Rajani, Farida, and Darman, revealed commonalities in the following areas during interviews: They had learned new skills while at Omron and were promoted, disability functioning had improved as a result of their work, overall confidence and moral had improved, income earned was greater than before they began work, and finally, they would recommend training and working at Omron to other persons with disabilities.

---

<sup>14</sup> ADA General Information on Accommodations. Retrieved on 07-09-2011 from: <http://ada.ky.gov/accommodations.htm>

## Omron featured employees: Their stories and perspectives

- ❖ Kusmiadi has been an operator at Omron since 2007. He came in at high school grade 1A level, and has since been promoted to level 3A. This is the same level as many of the new comers with diplomas.
- ❖ Rajani Siregan is 22 years old, works on assembly, and arrived six months ago. He trained at the NVRC for eight months, and lives very close so he rides the bus to work every day. He says in the future he would like to learn how to program the machines and would recommend this job to other persons with disabilities.
- ❖ Farida is 30 years old and works in the case inserting department. Her disability does not interfere with her ability to do her job. She also trained at the NVRC for eight months before coming to Omron, has been at Omron for 10 months, and has never had a job previously. She explained that she feels more confident than she did before she was working. She is very enthusiastic and says two years from now she hopes that she will have received a promotion because she “wants to learn everything!”
- ❖ Darman Saputra is a 27 year old technician and working on machine maintenance and repair. He has been working at Omron for seven months and was trained at NVRC. He says the easiest thing about his job is using the machines while the most difficult is programming them. He exclaims that his life and functioning level have improved since he began working at Omron. Before he started work he was often asking his parents for money, but now, he says proudly, he is able to support them. Darman says he would recommend Omron to other persons with disabilities and to his friends because the company is able to provide good, strong jobs, with favourable working conditions.
- ❖ President Director Santoso finished by telling the story of one employee who had been in a severe accident and hit his head on his way home from work. Eventually, after the employee had gone through some rehabilitation he was able to return to work in a low pressure position and slowly move his way up.

Mr. Santoso felt that this was a future investment not only for Omron but in the livelihood of the employee.

**Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)**

Omron's increasing awareness of environment and social concerns leads to their keen community involvement and CSR promotion. Similar to Indosiar, the government of Indonesia recognized Omron with an award as one of the three best companies of 2010. Aside from their guarantee that all of their products are environmentally friendly, other distinctions include support for cultural activities and sports contributing, in particular, to improved quality of life for people with disabilities.

### **III. Conclusion**

The increasing interest of companies to promote diversity in the workplace through CSR, and the growing perception of the validity of the business case for hiring persons with disabilities (i.e. it makes good business sense, persons with disabilities represent an untapped resource of work power and consumers, and they make productive, reliable employees), has prompted employers, trade unions, MNCs, and government-run entities to actively promote inclusion of persons with disabilities in the world of work, around the world, and in some cases in Indonesia.

These factors indicate that the same entities and organizations in Indonesia can improve upon existing policies and practices through the provision of policy statements related to non-discrimination and persons with disabilities, disability awareness training for management and co-workers, reasonable accommodation to meet individual needs, internships and training programmes specifically oriented to youth and persons with disabilities, and collaborations and partnerships with unions, NGOs, and DPOs especially regarding disability awareness training, accessibility, and product development.

The case studies showcase positive examples of organizations and business, which are addressing some of these issues in Indonesia.

The ILO's decent work goal is to promote equal employment and educational opportunities through labour standards, advocacy, and technical cooperation services and partnerships. It hopes that by featuring examples of good case practices in Indonesia, it will prompt other entities and organizations in supporting CSR activities in their communities, build capacities of businesses and organizations hiring and serving people with disabilities, and encourage the creation of relevant policies on work practices regarding persons with disabilities.

## **IV. ANNEX**

1. Resources
2. Listing of Company Information and Persons Interviewed
3. Interview Questions

### **1. Resources**

The International Labour Organization AbilityAsia Pacific:

<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/bangkok/ability/index.htm>

ILO.(n.d.)*Brief Profile on Disability:*  
[http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed\\_emp/documents/publication/wcms\\_140958.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/documents/publication/wcms_140958.pdf)

ILO. Buckup, S. 2009. The price of exclusion: The economic consequences of excluding people with disabilities from the world of work. Employment Sector Working Paper No. 43 (Geneva, ILO).

ILO. 2010. *Disability in the Workplace: Company Practices* ([http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/actemp/downloads/publications/working\\_paper\\_n3.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/actemp/downloads/publications/working_paper_n3.pdf))

ILO.Gilbert, M.; ILO Skills and Employability Department. 2008. Count us in! How to make sure women with disabilities can participate effectively in mainstream women's entrepreneurship development activities (Geneva, ILO).

ILO.O'Reilly, A. 2007.The right to decent work of persons with disabilities (Geneva, ILO).  
<http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1177&context=gladnetcollect&sei-redir=1#search=%22OReilly%20right%20decent%20work%22>

ILO. 2007. *"The employment situation of people with disabilities: Towards improved statistical information"* and on-line at:  
<http://www.ilocarib.org.tt/portal/images/stories/contenido/pdf/Disability/statsguide.pdf>)

ILO. 2008. From rights to reality: Trade unions promoting decent work for persons with disabilities. Video (Geneva).

The World Health Organization (WHO) World Report on Disability 2011:  
[http://www.who.int/disabilities/world\\_report/2011/en/index.html](http://www.who.int/disabilities/world_report/2011/en/index.html)

ILO Global Business and Disability Network:

Debra Perry, Senior Specialist in Disability Inclusion, ILO  
[perry@ilo.org](mailto:perry@ilo.org), +41.22.799.6258

Henrik Moller, Senior Advisor, Bureau for Employers' Activities, ILO

[moller@ilo.org](mailto:moller@ilo.org), +41.22.799.79520 or write to: ILO Business and Disability Network,  
email: [businessanddisability@ilo.org](mailto:businessanddisability@ilo.org)

ILO Global Business and Disability Network developed a playlist on ILO TV  
(<http://www.youtube.com/ilotv>)

## **2. Listing of Company Information and Persons Interviewed**

### **2.1 P.T. Indosiar Visual Mandiri**

National Television Broadcasting Station  
Jl. Damai No. 11, Daan Mogot  
Jakarta, Indonesia  
11510

+62 21 5672222, 5688888

Fax: +62 21 5655662

[Http://www.indosiar.com](http://www.indosiar.com)

Person Interviewed:

Mr. Gufroni Sakaril, Public Relations

[gufroni@indosiar.com](mailto:gufroni@indosiar.com)

### **2.2 Indonesia Prosperity Trade Union Confederation KSBSI Konfererasi Serikat Buruh Sejahtera Indonesia**

Jl. Cipinang Muara Raya No. 33  
Jati Negara  
Jakarta Timur,  
Indonesia

+62 21 70986246

[Http://www.ksbsi.or.id](http://www.ksbsi.or.id)

Person Interviewed: Ms. Sulistri, Dupty President

[Sulistri@hotmail.com](mailto:Sulistri@hotmail.com)

### **2.3 National Vocational Rehabilitation Center (NVRC) Balai Besar Rehabilitasi Vokasional Bina Daksa (BBRVBD)**

Jl. SKB No. 5 Karadenan  
Cibinong-Bogor  
Indonesia, 16913

+62 51 864702-8654705

Fax: +62 51 8654701

[Http://www.bbrvd.go.id](http://www.bbrvd.go.id)

[Http://www.bbrvbd.com](http://www.bbrvbd.com)

Person Interviewed:  
Mr. Tunggul Sianipar, Director General  
[nvrc@bbvbd.go.id](mailto:nvrc@bbvbd.go.id)  
[libang@bbvbd.com](mailto:libang@bbvbd.com)

#### **2.4 PT Omron Manufacturing of Indonesia**

EJIP Industrial Park-Plot 5 C  
Lemahang, Bekasi  
Indonesia, 17550

+62 21 8970111  
Fax: +62 21 8970120  
[enquiryid@ap.omron.com](mailto:enquiryid@ap.omron.com)

Persons Interviewed:

Mr. Irawan Santoso, President Director, Mr. Yuntadi Andhim, Manager Industrial Relations, Mr. Cahyadi Wibisono, Manager Administration Division, and Mr. Muhammad Fajar, Industrial Relations Supervisor

### **3. Interview Questions**

#### **3.1 DRAFT CASE STUDY OUTLINE FOR COMPANIES THAT HIRE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES**

##### **Section 1: Basic Employer Information**

Name of company

Address

Web site

Contact person

Title

Phone

Fax

Email address

Date of interview or visit

##### **Section 2: Description of company and disabled employees**

Type of company or description of the business (what is does):

National/Multinational:

Geographic area covered:

Nature of this business in relation to parent company if applicable: (subsidiary, branch office, etc.)

Total number of employees at the company or site being reviewed:

Total of number disabled employees and the percentage of the total labour force:

Types of disabilities represented and specific numbers if available:

Overall length of employment:

Nature of the work done by disabled persons

### **Section 3: Disability experience---getting started**

What motivated your company to hire people with disabilities? How did it get started?

Where there any initial obstacles or did any develop?

How were/are these obstacles or barriers handled?

Please describe the benefits you have experienced as a result of hiring people with disabilities?

How have your perceptions or those of the staff and others changed as a result of hiring workers with disabilities?

Did you or your staff engage in any special training related to hiring or managing disabled persons?

Do you have any partners or organizations that assist you?

What is your greatest human resource challenge?

How have hiring disabled persons contributed to meeting the challenges?

### **Section 4: Recruitment and adaptations**

How do you source or find disabled job applicants?

Have you had to make any changes or accommodations to your recruitment process?

Have you had to make any changes to the physical work environment for accommodations?

What was the cost involved?

Did these changes have any positive benefits to the workplace or other employees?

Have you had to make job accommodations for individual employees?

What percentages of disabled employees need accommodations?

What are the costs involved?

Can you give some examples of accommodations?

### **Section 5: Policies and written materials**

Do you have a written policy related to hiring disabled persons? Can you share it with us?

Do you have any promotional or other written material related to hiring disabled persons? Can you share it with us?

Have you received any recognition or awards for your work in hiring or training people with disabilities?

### **Section 6: Work place visit: Managers or supervisors**

What did you notice about the workplace with regard to integrating people with disabilities?

What did managers have to say about integrating disabled persons in their units or divisions?

What did managers have to say about the productivity of disabled workers? As compared with non-disabled workers?

What benefits and challenges did they perceive?

### **Section 7: Disabled employees**

Name:

Job title:

Benefits of working with the company

Challenges or issues that had to be addressed:

Career plans:

Can photos be used for unlimited purposes such as on web site, in brochures, etc?

### **Section 8: Union representative**

What is the union's role in the initiative?

How does the union perceive the training or hiring of people with disabilities?

What does the union do to make sure that disabled employees are adequately integrated or represented?

Has the union had to make any adjustments or accommodations?

### **3.2 Questions for Trade Unions**

1. What is the union's role with workers with disabilities (or Persons who have been hurt on the job)?
2. What is the Union trying to do about work-related accidents? How do you represent the workers who have been injured?
3. Have you been involved in rehabilitation programmes?
4. Politically what have you been fighting for (workers)?
5. What have you done if anything in promoting the 1% quota?
6. Do you actively engage in awareness raising and promoting inclusion of persons with disabilities in the workforce?
7. Do you know of cases when people with disabilities have complained about accommodation by their employers?